

TRANSCRIPT WITH COMMENTARY

Phil J.: A neuroscience writer

Phil Interview 4

Below in black is a word-for-word transcript of the June 3 interview with Phil that is available on YouTube at <https://youtu.be/47vqJR9t5rY>. In green are comments about and explanations of the Descriptive Experience Sampling process. If you have corrections, suggestions, or questions, please post them as YouTube comments.

RTH = Russ Hurlburt

CK = Cody Kaneshiro

AG = Amber Goto

Phil = Phil J.

0:01 RTH: So this is going to be Phil's fourth day at this, I think.

0:05 Phil: Correct, yeah.

0:07 RTH: And any sampling issues that we should be talking about before we launch into the beeps?

0:13 Phil: Um, no, no, it was fine.

0:16 RTH: Then I would say I'm ready.

SAMPLE 4.1 DISCUSSION STARTS HERE

0:19 Phil: Okay. Now, yeah, we, I think we should go, we should proceed relatively quickly cuz there were some relatively more complex, um, experiences. So, and the first one is one of them, So, okay, I will read you what I wrote in my log yesterday, while I was sitting eating lunch, I began to ponder what Eva-stina and I could make for, for dinner for her parents when they come to visit next week. In the moments right before the beep again, there was, there seemed to be a multiplicity of inner experiences that overlapped at least in part. The earliest consisted of innerly saying to myself with words, *what should we make?* And then immediately I began to answer myself with "I" in hopes that an idea would come to mind and I would be able to continue with something like *think we should make* whatever idea came to mind. Just before the beep is when I had innerly said "I" and I glanced out the window and noticed our red current bush blowing in the wind. I apprehended the vigorousness with which it shook and the greenness of its leaves as they danced against the blue sky. Oh, so poetic. Um, yet there was actually another quality I perceived the bush somehow in the context of our neighbor's backyard and house. Um, so earlier, a large cardboard box that I wanted to break up, had blown into their yard. And I had just been creating a game plan for trying to sneak into the yard to remove it. The bush is more or less parallel with the lateral border of their yard and with my memory of the position of the box in the yard. While noticing the dancing leaves or perhaps immediately after I had an

awareness of the layout of the yard and the, the location of the box as if they were connected in some way with the current bush. It was a similar feeling to the awareness one feels before turning to grasp an object within reach, but out of view. And that's what I have. So if there's something you, you, you can be talking and you know, something's over here and you, you just have an awareness of it and you, you can reach for it like a mug or something. It was similar to that.

- 2:47 RTH: So as, as best you can say, are all those things in your direct experience right at the moment of the beep?
- 2:55 Phil: Yes. I mean, it, it was, um.
- 2:58 RTH: I'm not trying to talk you out of it, I just wanna make sure I understand.
- 3:01 Phil: I, I think those things did overlap. I think myself saying "I" and apprehending or noticing the, the leaves dancing and in, in having an awareness of *that* bush in the context of *that* backyard and where that cardboard box was, um, seemed to, it just seemed to overlap, yes.
- 3:24 RTH: And, and all sort of equally present to you or one more powerful than the other?
- 3:34 Phil: I would say that maybe myself saying, "I" and noticing the, I would say that noticing, yeah, okay. I, I, as I remember it, noticing the leaves dancing was, was, the name was, I would say was maybe, uh, 40 and the, and myself saying "I" was maybe 30 and then the awareness of that bush in the context of the art and the box was the other 30.
- 4:13 RTH: Okay. And, and is the, the bush part, is that about the motion dancing portion or is that about the color of red against blue or some of both or?
- 4:27 Phil: Mm, I guess both. It was the, the, the leaves were very green. Things are getting nice and green here now and, and it actually has leaves now. And I noticed them really vigorously shaking in the wind.
- 4:43 RTH: So the it's the green leaves shaking and it's the green and the shaking, that are?
- 4:48 Phil: Yeah, it's it's little green objects shaking against, um, and the sky was very blue, so it was a very, colorful. I was looking through the window and, and it, it was, it was very colorful and it was moving very fast, so.
- 5:06 RTH: And, and it was just between those two, between the colorfulness and the shakiness is one of those aspects more salient to you, or is it that these colorful things are shaking and that's one unit kind of a deal?
- 5:22 Phil: It was one unit kind of a deal.
- 5:23 RTH: Okay.
- 5:24 Phil: Yeah.

- 5:27 RTH: And, and then what I'm gathering about the, the *speaking* is that you had said slightly moments, a moment before the beep, *what should we make?* [Phil: Yeah.] And now, and that's gone [Phil: Yeah.] and I'm answering myself? So it's not like there's two strands of inner speaking it's that there's one strand of inner speaking and another strand, that's a reply and the beep catches you in the second one, is that right?
- 5:52 Phil: Correct. Yeah.
- 5:54 RTH: Alright. And, and about that, is that your voice talking the way it generally?
- 6:05 Phil: Um, yeah, it was my voice. It was, it had a very conversational feel to it. Um, *what, what should we make? I, I think we should make, I, it's something I do often to, I think I was, I think there was another example similar to this earlier. Um, but it's something I do often I just, I pose the question to myself and then I start to answer it, even though I don't know what the answer is going to be, but I hope as I start the answer, something comes to mind.*
- 6:45 RTH: So we have talked about a couple of strands of, of where you have, you seem to have a strategy where you start something in the, with the expectation that it's gonna, it's gonna finish itself somehow?
- 6:56 Phil: Yeah. Yes. Whether it does or not, most of the time, I have no idea, but.
- 7:04 RTH: Seems, seems like a reasonable strategy to me.
- 7:06 Phil: [laughs]
- 7:08 RTH: Um, and, and, and about the, the location. So this is a, this is a sense of your neighbor's backyard, including the bush that's in your yard, is that right?
- 7:28 Phil: Yeah. The bush is just outside the window, um, right beside the window. Um, and, uh, yeah, if you, you could make a line from the bush going on the lateral side of the neighbor's backyard and then the, the box is just inside the yard there somewhere. And I had just been coming up with a plan of how it could go into their backyard and nab it, and, and do this as quickly and efficiently as possible before somebody sees me in the yard thinking that I'm some strange person snooping around or something.
- 8:06 RTH: Okay. And, and is all that present this strange person snooping around and do it quickly?
- 8:12 Phil: No. No. No.
- 8:14 RTH: Or is this about the geometry of the yard?
- 8:17 Phil: This is about the geometry of the yard, yes.

- 8:20 RTH: So the context for wondering or considering the geometry of the yard is I gotta figure out how to snag this box, but the experience at the moment is about the yard shape, yard?
- 8:35 Phil: Yeah. Just the, the, the location of the box and the, the, you, you have to. Yeah, it's a little bit complicated, it's not, uh, so there's a hill to get to their yard from, from our yard, you have to sort of go down a, a steep, but small hill. And then, um, their yard is also connected with the other neighbor, the neighbor beside them, their yard. Um, [RTH: Okay.] yeah it's, it's not just like a yard you can just walk into, you have to, you have to, it needs a little bit of strategy.
- 9:15 RTH: So I think I'm happy with all of that. Does anybody else have questions?
- 9:21 CK: I had a quick question. Um, Phil, about the speaking, you said that, um, it was, you were in the middle of saying, I, the beep goes off and in actuality, right. Like if the beep, if the beep never happened, it would continue with like, y'know, I think we should make, and then whatever idea comes up next.
- 9:42 Phil: Yeah.
- 9:42 CK: Is that all in your experience at the moment of the beep? Like, cuz I know in reality that would be true, but you know, experience doesn't necessarily follow that. So at the moment of the beep, was it just the "I" portion of that or the whole sentence or?
- 9:54 Phil: It was just the "I."
- 9:56 CK: Okay.
- 9:57 Phil: Yeah. I, I, I suppose it was possible that I was distracted by seeing the leaves shaking in the wind. And then going back to thinking about the neighbor's backyard and, and that box that was in there.
- 10:14 CK: Sure. Yeah. Thankfully we don't have to figure out why these things happen we just have to figure out what, and it's hard enough just to know sometimes, right, like what's going on, but that's great, okay. I just wanted to, by that.
- 10:25 Phil: Yup.
- 10:28 CK: Okay.
- 10:28 RTH: Onward?
- 10:28 CK: I'm good.
- 10:30 RTH: Cody, you wanna inquire about number 2?

SAMPLE 4.2 DISCUSSION STARTS HERE

- 10:32 CK: Yeah. Uh, alright Phil, uh, beep 2.
- 10:35 Phil: Okay. I was walking with my flip flops on which by their name make rhythmic flip flop noises with each step. I stopped and then at the moment before the beep, I had just heard a brief, dull, hollowish *pop* noise that I believe was just in time with what would've been the flip flop noise coinciding with my next step. Our new puppy, Max, was chewing on an empty Pringles container in the adjacent room, and I believe the noise actually came from a warping of the container on a good bite. I noticed the noise because it had a strange quality to it. It was though I imagined it and it wasn't real. I had stopped moving and a noise in time with what would've been my next step wasn't possible because I had stopped and I was motionless. To create this entry I had to ponder if there was a real source to the noise and what it might be. Soon after I was able to match it to Max's Pringle container noises. That's that.
- 11:43 CK: Okay. So just to make sure I'm understanding this correctly, [Phil: Yeah, sure.] at the moment of the, at the moment of the beep, this is, there's just basically one, maybe single thing. The, the, the main thing in experience is this noise, right, hearing the noise, [Phil: Yeah.] the walking sort of context, right. Um, [Phil: Yup.] the dog in the room is, I mean, that's happening in reality, but like at the moment, the beep I'm, I'm hearing this pop right, a hollowish kind of pop sound.
- 12:09 Phil: Yup.
- 12:10 CK: Okay. Um, and so you said just a minute ago, right. That there was something that felt made up of this or artificial it, or I, I'm forgetting the exact words, but you said something to the effect of like that this was something [Phil: Imagined.] imagined, right? [Phil: Yeah, yeah.] Um, is, is that present in your experience at the moment of the beep? Y'know, I can imagine there's sort of multiple things of that right, could actually be that, that was really there in my, in that was part of the hearing is like somehow I'm hearing an imagined sound or that can be sort of the result of context right, of?
- 12:44 Phil: Yeah. Just to put it as simply as possible, the, the, the beep went off and then, uh, my first thought was it was that noise, but was that noise? Did, did I actually hear that noise or, or did, did I, well not hallucinate it by just sort of imagine it, cuz it, it didn't sound quite like the noise my flip flops make, but it, it, it was in vaguely similar and, and it was the timing that was just perfect. So it was like *flip flop flip flop flip* [popping noise] *pop* noise just at the exact moment my next step would've been.
- 13:26 CK: So that sounds to me, I don't want to talk you in or out of this, but that sounds like that's more of a reaction, right. like really at, at the moment of the beep the experience was totally just hearing this noise, but as soon as the beep catches you, right, it's sort of like given in the context of it, it's sort of like, well, that's really surprising cause I'm not moving anymore, and what what's that about, right? But that, the experience was just about hearing that *pop* sound like you said, or just like that hollow, right?

- 13:51 Phil: Right, right. But in trying to describe that experience, an important aspect of it is that it, it, um. Yeah, I guess you're right. That, that I, well, you are correct, it is, it is a reaction to it. It, it, it was just the noise that was in experience regardless of whether or not it was real or imagined, but I'm just, I'm trying to just describe it as accurately as possible.
- 14:25 CK: I'm afraid, I, I don't wanna talk you out of any of this too, that's the thing I, I don't, I don't wanna necessarily feel like you have to come with me along with that or not I, I just wanna make sure that I'm understanding you, right. That at least based on what you were saying, that was my take, but I'm happy to be corrected on that or, y'know, I'm missing the marks.
- 14:42 Phil: Yeah, yeah. I'm just trying to say that there was, um, okay. Like if you hear a loud bang and you're, you're right beside a construction site, you know, that bang, it, it, you didn't imagine it, it came from the construction site, but this one, it there. Yeah, okay, maybe I put it differently. And there was a quality of this noise, regardless of whether it was real or imagined that it, that made it seem imagined more than other noises that I perceive, because it was right in time with what would've been my next step, but I wasn't moving anymore.
- 15:33 RTH: That was, that was present to you in the hearing of it, rather than in the retrospect of it?
- 15:42 Phil: That it was in time with my next step.
- 15:45 RTH: That the, that the somehow imagined weird quality of it was part of the hearing of it in the hearing of it, rather than in the looking back at it, that's the question I think Cody and I are trying to get at.
- 15:59 Phil: Yeah. Um, uh, yeah, I'm trying to like, hmm. I hope I'm not being back and forth, it's, it's difficult, but. It was in the hearing of it because afterwards I wasn't sure if it was a real noise or not, so it must have been in the hearing of it.
- 16:25 RTH: So what's happening is that before the beep it's *flip, flop, flip, flop*, and at the beep is *flip, flop, flip, flop, pop*, and the pop is a, has a un, uncertainty to it, whether this is, uh, coming from my flip flop coming from somewhere else, coming from my imagination that's in, in the hearing of that pop?
- 16:55 Phil: Yes. I mean, I did say, *did I, did I actually hear that, or did I imagine it*, but I, I, I said that because there was a strangeness to the sound and that was a, a part of the experience of *that* sound was that it was vague and possibly imagined and, and not actually, and, and not real.
- 17:18 RTH: Okay.
- 17:21 Phil: I hope that makes sense, but it does, to me in some way.
- 17:26 RTH: Makes sense to me.

- 17:27 CK: Mm hmm.
- 17:27 Phil: Okay.
- 17:31 CK: I'm good on, I'm good on that beep if anyone has any other questions.
- 17:35 RTH: And, and the fact that it's a Pringle can, that is entirely retrospective. It's, it's not the case that in the moment of the beep I'm hearing a Pringle can. At the moment of the beep I'm hearing a *pop* that has some, I don't know what that is quality to it, [Phil: Right, yeah.] later on I figure out it's probably a Pringle can?
- 17:54 Phil: Right, yeah, yeah, yeah.
- 18:00 RTH: Alright, then I'm ready to go on to number 3.
- 18:02 CK: Yup.
- 18:02 RTH: And Amber should I ask about this, or you wanna ask about this?
- 18:05 AG: Um, you can ask about this.
- 18:07 RTH: Alright, number 3.

SAMPLE 4.3 DISCUSSION STARTS HERE

- 18:09 Phil: Uh, hey Amber. Um, okay. Number 3, I was, I was outside in the backyard and Max was playing. Just Max was playing, um, just out of view, down in a little gully beside the next door neighbor's house. Um, I glanced to see if I could see if he, I glanced to see if he came out of the gully on one end. The beep occurred just after I turned my gaze in the direction of the gully and the side of the house. Immediately before the beep, I noticed a long stem of a solitary dead plant against the side of the, against the side of the house, which caught my attention because it, it stood out against the white paneling. Um, upon closer investigation, it turned out to be a stick with a slight curve. I did not pay attention to its shape, color or the whiteness of the side of the house I perceived it independently of any relation to Max or his location. So I think this one, I, well, who knows where this will go, but I believe this one is, is relatively straightforward. I, I glanced over and the first thing I noticed was this, this stick on the side of the, by the side of the house there.
- 19:38 RTH: So my understanding that the, that the Max and looking for Max, that's the sort of context what's happening, but my experiences about the stick.
- 19:47 Phil: Yes. Yeah. [RTH: Okay.] I didn't see him, I didn't hear him, I just glanced in his general direction and I happened to notice this, this stick.
- 20:00 RTH: And, and so, so my experience is of seeing, I see the stick, which I, at the moment of the beep I take to be the, a dead plant stem?

20:11 Phil: Yes.

20:11 RTH: Later on it turns out to be a stick?

20:13 Phil: Yeah.

20:14 RTH: Is that right?

20:16 Phil: Yeah.

20:17 RTH: And, and I am not particularly, I'm gathering, seeing, seeing anything of any particular detail of it, it's not the color of it, it's not the contrast of the color against the white? [Phil: No.] For whatever reason, I'm interested in this plant stem later on, it turns out to be a stick and the?

20:37 Phil: I don't know, I'm not particularly interested in it. It's just the first thing that I happen to notice when I glanced over in that direction to like, *hey, where is he*, and then that's the, just the first thing I happened to notice.

20:54 RTH: So lemme make sure I got beep timing right. So I glance over *where is he*, I see a stick that beep, the beep catches me in the seeing of the stick?

21:02 Phil: Correct.

21:04 RTH: So maybe the term, my term interest was too strong that in the stick has captured my attention for lack of a better word.

21:19 Phil: Yeah. Yeah. Side of the house is, is, is white. There's no, there's nothing. Well, it was a side of the portion, like there's an entrance way, there's some stairs going down to an entrance way and, and it's the side of the entrance way. But it's very broad, it's very white, there's nothing on it, it's, it's blank. And, um, I would say the only thing in front of it is, uh, the stick, so it drew my attention.

21:51 RTH: Okay. And the whiteness I'm gathering is something of the context, it's not like I'm noticing whiteness, I'm noticing...

21:59 Phil: Right. I, I've looked at the, the side of this house a gazillion times, so I don't, uh, I don't, I don't particularly notice it's color or it's whiteness or anything anymore.

22:13 RTH: So at the moment of the beep my attention is captured by a stem of a plant, which later turns out to be a stick, and that's basically all that's happening at this particular moment?

22:23 Phil: Yeah.

22:25 RTH: And sooner or later I'm gonna come back and find Max and whatever, but, but at the moment it's a stem?

- 22:34 Phil: Yeah.
- 22:36 RTH: Then I think I'm good.
- 22:40 CK: Me as well.
- 22:41 Phil: Okay.
- 22:44 RTH: Number 4.

SAMPLE 4.4 DISCUSSION STARTS HERE

- 22:47 Phil: Okay. Um, yeah, this one's a little more complex as well. Um, I was looking well, I was sitting, I was having a glass of wine with Eva-stina and, uh, we have a nice view of this, this mountain to, towards the, the back. Um, I was looking up in the distance at a vis, a visible portion of an incline leading up from the base of a mountain where a cross country ski trail runs way up to a plateau. I was approximating where the ski trail runs. And although it hasn't been tracked out for probably a couple months, there appeared to still be enough snow there that you could ski if you wanted to. I was scanning along lines of remaining snow parallel with the ski track. And, um, at the moment before the beep, without words, I had a notion of *could still ski*. It was like, I was saying it to myself, but without words. As an active skier, I, so this is sort of, I put this as a separate paragraph as an active skier, I often check different locations in the surrounding mountains at this time of year to see if skiing is still possible, as there's often snow remaining well into summer. I've likely said to myself, if not others, many times you could still ski there while looking at these familiar locations. It's like I said, could still ski there so often that I, I don't actually need to use words to say it to myself anymore.
- 24:29 CK: Okay. And so, I'm understanding you to be saying that there's, there's something about, like you said, some, something like could still, there's something about the skiing portion that you could still do that that's present to you at the moment of the beep. [Phil: Yeah.] And what I'm curious about here is, y'know, um, exactly *how* that was present to you. I know you were, you, you had already kind of given us sort of a first draft of there's this notion of that there. And it feels as though maybe you're saying this to yourself, but without words, but I think it's possible that this could also be, y'know, you gave some context about, there have been times in the past where you had said this and y'know, this is something that you typically do. And, and so I wanted just to sort of, um, take another pass at just asking, y'know, like, how is this, how is this present at the moment?
- 25:31 Phil: That's, this is very difficult.
- 25:32 CK: And maybe, lemme try to, i, is this first and formal sort of just like a, again, it is, as if I'm saying it to myself, these, these words aren't necessarily present, but I get this notion of you, y'know, if, if there's this pretty specific thought, like I could still ski there. But when I'm talking about it, now I have to put it into words, it wasn't in words

initially, but it was that specific of a thought at the moment of the beep, right, like *could still ski*.

25:57 Phil: Yeah.

25:57 CK: It could be that it could be, I'm remembering the past times where I've said this before, and somehow this is like a recollection of saying it again or?

26:07 Phil: No.

26:08 CK: Okay.

26:08 Phil: No, it's just, it's kind of this thing I do. I look at different areas and, and I, I just, I enjoy the thought of if I wanted to, I could go there and, and ski. So I happened to be looking up at this spot and, and, um, I had this notion of yes, could still ski, but, uh, but there were no words in, involved. It was, yeah, it, it, it, there wasn't anything condensed about it I, I didn't have like a single word to sum it up, like look at it and say *ski*, as in, you can still ski there. It was just like, yup.

26:52 CK: Mm hmm, mm hmm. And, and is that *yup* or like that, that notion, like you said, right of like *could still ski*, is that, is that a emotional sort of reaction or, and emotion's too strong a word here, but, y'know, sort of like, like that you said *yup*, right, and I got the sense of like, [Phil: Oh, yeah, yeah.] there's some, like, like, like almost like.

27:12 Phil: No, I don't think it was, um, well, I mean, it is a little bit emotional because I like to, I like that if I wanted to, I could still see ski there, but it was just, um. I feel like it was more an assessment of, um, is there, like I was looking quite carefully at, at this, uh, at this part of the mountain, cuz it's, it's kinda right on the border and um, other parts that, that you could still ski on, let's say a few days ago are now I, I wouldn't bother. Um, so, so I was looking at it quite, quite carefully and uh, I had made my decision that yes, you could still ski.

27:56 CK: So this is, sorry go ahead.

27:57 RTH: And I take this to be something like an analytical, I have figured this out, I have accumulated the data and now I've?

28:08 Phil: Yup. Yes. Yup. Yeah.

28:12 RTH: So it's not just like a, it's not just in the *seeing* of it, it's in the analysis that's following the, seeing of it?

28:20 Phil: Yes. Yes.

28:21 RTH: And I'm presenting the results of that analysis to myself. [Phil: Yeah.] I could still ski, could still, *could still ski*.

28:31 Phil: Yeah, yup. [RTH: And that...] Yeah, I don't see, I don't need to use words to say that to myself because I've done it so many times, it was just like.

28:40 RTH: But that's a, that's an inter, that's a self interpretation I'm gathering. When at the moment of the beep, is at the moment of the beep I am conveying to myself without words *could still ski*.

28:51 Phil: Yeah. Yeah. [RTH: Okay.] It, I, I almost felt like I had, like, I had just said it, but, but I know that I didn't.

29:03 CK: Okay. [RTH: Okay.] And I took, I took you to, Phil, to be saying the, sort of the context was like the looking in the distance, that trail and all that stuff. Was that context or was that in your experience at the moment of the beep too? In other words, at the moment of the beep, is it just, this *could still ski* bit or is there anything else?

29:24 Phil: There was the visual aspect of it. [CK: Okay.] Cuz I was, I was looking quite carefully.

29:32 CK: So at the moment I'm simultaneously, I have this notion *could still ski* present and seeing the trail at the base of the...?

29:43 Phil: Approximately where the trail was and that there was, there was enough, there was enough snow still up there.

29:52 CK: And at the moment of the beep and, and at the moment of the beep, what exactly do you see? [Phil: I see...] Is it the trail, is it the mountain, the snow, the?

30:03 Phil: Um, see a couple of lines of snow, approximately where the trail is, and those lines are long enough, and ex, like they extend pretty much across the entire portion of that mountain that I could see that. And I, I sort of, yeah, okay, here's another aspect that I had not described. You when you go that way or when I imagine going that way, I imagine going in a certain direction. So I was scanning in that direction, along these lines of snow.

30:41 CK: And is that, I, I think I saw you going like right to left. Is that true or, [Phil: Correct.] In terms of direction, I'm scanning right?

30:47 Phil: South to north.

30:48 CK: South to north, okay. So this is sort of a, this is a scanning, a, a seeing and scanning of the mountain trail, seeing the snow and, uh, that notion of *could still ski*?

31:08 Phil: Yeah.

31:09 CK: For sure, okay.

31:10 Phil: Yeah. I mean, you don't have to ski on the, you like, you just need snow, right. But yeah.

31:19 CK: Then I think I'm good.

31:22 RTH: Good number 5.

SAMPLE 4.5 DISCUSSION STARTS HERE

31:28 Phil: Alright. I was out with Max at the front of the house. Um, my cat was there, the neighbor's cat, Sushi, was on the street in front of me and another local cat was about 20 yards down the street coming towards Sushi. Since cats tend to be territorial and dogs, chase cats, I exclaimed out loud *sadfu* *oh* at the general situation. At the moment before the beep, I glanced at Sushi with the approaching cat out of my field of view. I watched her move calmly, slowly lifting a paw to take a step as if she either didn't care or was oblivious to the other cat, me and the dog. I had an awareness of her location relative to the approaching cat again, as if they were somehow geometrically connected.

32:30 RTH: So I'm gathering that there's threeish kinds of things here, I'm saying aloud *uh oh*?

32:35 Phil: No, I, that, that happened a little bit prior to the, the moment immediately before the beep.

32:41 RTH: Okay. So at the, at the moment of the beep I'm seeing the cat take a indifferent step or something?

32:49 Phil: Yup.

32:50 RTH: And I am somehow aware of the geometry of the situation?

32:56 Phil: Yes.

32:59 RTH: And.

33:01 Phil: Yeah. Cuz right, right after that, I guess while the beep was going off, I, I, I glanced back at the approaching cat to see if, just to see how close it was while I had how much closer it got while I had looked at Sushi and to see if it was still approaching.

33:23 RTH: But that's after the...

33:24 Phil: ...that's after the...

33:25 RTH: ...after the moment of the detail, we're interested in?

33:27 Phil: But I'm just describing my awareness of the, the, their locations and the, the geometry of the situation.

33:37 RTH: Mm hmm. And, and would you say that geometry is more or less present than the stepping motion of the cat?

33:47 Phil: Uh, it was less present.

33:49 RTH: So the watching the cat walk is the, the seeing of the cat walking is the most pro, most prominent part?

33:58 Phil: Yes. Yeah.

34:01 RTH: 9, 90-10, 60-40?

34:02 Phil: I would say, I would say, I would say yeah, 90-10?

34:08 RTH: Really? So the, so *mostly* I'm watching this cat walk?

34:12 Phil: Yeah.

34:13 RTH: Alright. So let's, let's start there then. So tell me again, what, what do you see?

34:21 Phil: Um, the cat was just, it was lifting up its, as I remember it, it was just lifting up one of its front paws to take a step.

34:35 RTH: So I could understand that in several different ways, one is I'm, I'm watching the paw lift up. Another is I'm seeing this cat move, and as a matter of fact, the paw is lifting up. And another is, I'm noticing the indifference of the cat, the apparent indifference of the cat to her surroundings and maybe there's other possibilities too but?

35:01 Phil: Um, I wasn't directly focused on the, the, the cat's paw moving. Uh, I was just taking in the movement of the entire cat and at that instance, um, all I saw that was moving was, was that front paw. Um, I wasn't, um, I wasn't noticing its color or, or, or I didn't have any particular awareness of its shape or, or, um, or anything like that. It's just that what I happened to notice was the, the motion of the, of the paw as it was taking a step away from the, um, the approaching cat.

36:07 RTH: So I understand that in the physical world, the cat is raising its paw. It takes a step. And I understand that in the real physical world, it is stepping away from the approaching cat.

36:23 Phil: Yes.

36:25 RTH: I don't, but my interest is not particularly in the physical world, it's in the Phil experiential world. So am I watching the footstep? Am I watching the departure of the cat? Am I just *seeing* what's happening unfold without, without...

36:50 Phil: Yeah.

36:51 RTH: ...making anything particularly thematic for myself?

36:56 Phil: Yeah. So yeah, I am. Yeah, I'm just seeing what what's unfolding, um, with an awareness that this could become, um, a tense situation between these animals.

- 37:15 RTH: And is that awareness sort of shape the way I'm looking? So I'm looking with awareness of I'm, I'm looking at the stepping from the perspective of, is this going to be a problem or is it? [Phil: Yes.Yes.] So the, the potential problematics is a grounding feature of the seeing here?
- 37:44 Phil: Yes.
- 37:45 RTH: So I'm not, is it, is it?...
- 37:47 Phil: It was my reason for glancing at the cat in the first place. So I had been looking at the approaching cat and I was aware that Sushi was just across the street from me. So I looked at sushi to see what she was doing. And she happened to be taking, taking a step away from, from the approaching cat and her, the movement of the paw is, is what I noticed. But there was an awareness of the location of the approaching cat and the situation of all of these animals and it could turn out bad.
- 38:29 RTH: So I'm gathering from that, that the motion of the paw is *not* merely a fact of the universe that she's retreating, and, and at this particular moment, it happens to be this paw moving. It's that for some reason, I am watching the motion of the paw in the context of seeing the retreat, is that right?
- 38:54 Phil: Um, I, I...
- 38:57 RTH: ...So the question is, the question is...
- 39:00 Phil: ... I don't know, I don't know if she was retreating cuz she was like I said, she was moving quite slowly as if she didn't really care. But it wasn't the, it was in the opposite direction of the oncoming cat, so maybe, maybe that was the reality of the moment, but in my, in my own experience, um, I wasn't, I wasn't thinking of her as, as necessarily retreating. I just kind of wanted to see what she was doing if, if yeah, I, yeah.
- 39:40 RTH: So it seems more reasonable to say I'm watching the footsteps of my cat than it is to say, I am seeing my cat retreat and she happens to be taking footsteps? [Phil: Right.] This is about, this is about the footsteps, the paw, the paw motion, my experience at this particular moment is more about the paw motion than it is about the, whether she's retreating? [Phil: Yup.] The reason I'm doing it, as I wanna know whether she's retreating, cuz I gotta know whether I'm gonna be involved in some scrape between cats or whatever?
- 40:17 Phil: Yeah.
- 40:17 RTH: But uh, but at the *moment* my experience is making thematic for myself, the rising paw of the footstep?
- 40:30 Phil: What do you mean by thematic?

40:35 RTH: Well, in my visual field, there's a lot of stuff going on there's the, I, she's no doubt swaying to the left and her tail is going this way and there's the black of the concrete or the?

40:47 Phil: Oh, okay, okay. Something, I guess something, I suppose I didn't describe, but she wasn't um, she was just kind of standing there. She wasn't, she wasn't walking. She, she had just sort of started walking, started to take a first step from a standing still position.

41:13 RTH: Okay. So I think, I, I think I'm good about that, so

41:25 Phil: Are you sure? I saw, you were thinking about something there.

41:28 RTH: Well, I was, I was trying to, I was trying to, so let me, let me say what I, what I think it is and you tell me whether I'm astray or not. So I've, I've been watching the cat's, the potential for cat scrape. [Phil: Mm hmm.] And now I'm looking at Sushi and I watch her take a, I watch her begin to take a step?

41:57 Phil: Yeah.

41:58 RTH: And I can sorta retrospectively now I'm trying to explain it to these guys. I can, I can say, well, she was sort of indifferent, it was her left paw going up, she had been stopped now she's starting, but I'm at the, at the moment, what I'm, what I'm really seeing is the step?

42:19 Phil: Yup.

42:19 RTH: And all those features are part, portions of the step that I could, I could make a deal of if I wanted to, but I'm not particularly doing it, I'm just seeing Sushi take a step?

42:32 Phil: Mostly, but there is, um, there is an awareness of her location relative to the, relative to the oncoming cat and the context of the situation.

42:43 RTH: And that's other, that's the other 10% that we're talking about, is that, [Phil: Yeah.] Is that right? [Phil: Yeah.] And so, and so that's a, where, where all these cats are somehow present to me in my, in my direct experience, but lesser than the cat step?

43:03 Phil: Yeah. Yeah. Sushi's the neighbor's cat, she's not mine, but just, just, just for accuracy.

43:17 RTH: I take it that's context too, it's not like I'm, I'm noticing it's the neighbors cat, that's taking a step. It's a, this is Sushi's step?

43:26 Phil: Yeah. I see the cat all the time, I know the cat well, so yeah.

43:35 RTH: Then I think I'm good.

43:36 CK: Me too.

43:36 RTH: 6

43:36 CK: Alright, yup beep 6.

SAMPLE 4.6 DISCUSSION STARTS HERE

43:39 Phil: Okay. Number 6. Um, so it was, um, it was silent, I had my eyes closed and I was listening to my tinnitus. Um, which is a side effect of chemotherapy. I was noticing how despite it being characterized simply as a ringing sound, it seems to me more like multiple ringing noises. Since I believe I have it in both ears, it has a sort of three dimensional aspect with tones of different loudness in, in, in vague, but d, different locations, perceptively, different locations in and around my head. Somehow these locations seem connected to the direction in which I focus my attention. At the moment before the beep, I was hearing an alternation between what felt like two tones, one more towards the top of my head in, in one hemisphere on one side and the other more lateral in the other hemisphere. Um, but I, I, I could not say which side each tone was on. Um, and that that's, that's just what I have.

45:06 CK: So at the moment of the beep it's hearing the two, like the two altering sounds right, that that's what was present at the moment of the beep, am I understanding that correctly, Phil?

45:17 Phil: Yeah. I would say I switched from noticing sort of one tone to another tone. It's not like there, yeah it's really hard to describe this. Some, like sometimes when tinnitus really kicks in, I hear this, this loud, high pitched noise and it's, it's clearly identifiable, but otherwise if it's quiet, I just, I hear this, this ringing, but it, it's, it's like I can perceive ringing coming from sort of different locations and it's, it's very vague, but there is, um, there, there, there is a spatial quality to it.

46:01 CK: So I take you to be saying...

46:02 Phil: I happened to notice just before the beep, a change, I, a change from one location to another.

46:09 CK: Gotcha, okay, right. So at the moment of the beep, this is, a, I'm switching between hearing one ringing to another ring? [Phil: Ringing to another ringing, yeah.] Yeah I, I.

46:19 Phil: One ringing maybe sort of more over here [gestures to right side of head] to another ringing that's like more here [gestures above head] or something.

46:35 CK: And I know this, this might be a difficult question, but what exactly do you hear? Is, is this a, a ringing, a buzzing, a, none of those things?

46:47 Phil: Okay cuz tinnitus can, can, can be different. It's, it's a very high pitched ringing.

46:55 CK: So at the moment of the beep, I'm hearing a high pitched ring, two different high pitched ringing tones or something? [Phil: Yeah.] Ringing? [Phil: Yeah.] Um, and is this, a?

- 47:09 Phil: It's very hard to describe, [CK: Right.] it's like they both have the same frequency, but if, and it ,it's sort of, it's almost like it comes from wherever I happen to direct attention spatially. So if I change my attention to, or from somewhere over here to somewhere over here, the ringing sort of changes similarly is as best I can describe it. It's [CK: And is that...] quite difficult to describe,
- 47:43 CK: Is that part of the hearing at this moment that I'm hearing, y'know, I, I'm perceiving one ringing and another and I'm simultane, y'know part of that is I'm changing my attention from over here to over here.
- 47:56 Phil: Yup.
- 47:57 CK: Okay. But I take you to be saying that's sort of the, they're both sort of one and the same, right. It's not, these are not two separable sort of processes, right. Like I'm just, I'm directing my attention from here to here and the ringing changes from here to here?
- 48:10 Phil: Yeah. Yeah. That's a, that's a good way to put it, mm hmm.
- 48:13 CK: Um.
- 48:13 Phil: It's very vague.
- 48:18 RTH: So I'm not sure, I'm not sure I understood that. So is my experience of hearing a ringing here and a ringing here, or is my experience of directing my attention and as I do that, the ringing goes with it?
- 48:40 Phil: I just, I happen to be sort of listening to this ringing and, and trying to just sort of, I don't know, just, uh, just experience it and cuz I don't always mind it. And I was sort of in a, in a sleepy state thinking about the spatial quality to it and, and how it, it doesn't just sound like a general ringing that comes from nowhere or everywhere. And, and how it can have this sort of spatial quality to it. And in, I was kind of con, I don't know, it just felt like if I directed my attention spatially in, in one, in one direction, that's where it seemed to be. And then if I directed it at a different location, it seemed to sort of come from there. I hadn't quite concluded that, but I was just experiencing the ringing coming from different locations. And the beep caught me in a switch from one location to a, to another.
- 49:55 RTH: And so are, at the moment of the beep, are you actively exploring this location connection?
- 50:04 Phil: Yes, but not consciously thinking, hey, it changes locations. I'm just sort of, I don't know, just trying to experience.
- 50:15 RTH: So you sorta per, I gather you're perceptually poking around in your tinnitus experience?

- 50:23 Phil: Yeah. Yeah.
- 50:25 RTH: Without, without an analytical, without an analytical experience, like in the, in the skiing thing, I've, I've analyzed that and I've decided, oh, I could ski, there, could still ski there, but that is, that kind of analysis is not present here this is, [Phil: Right.] I'm poking around in the ski slopes of my tinnitus and uh [Phil: (laughs)] and.
- 50:52 Phil: Yeah, it, it just like, um, I was noticing how the, the tinnitus has a spatial quality to it, that, IN it, and, and a multi again, multiplicity, like it's not just one ring it seems like rings that can happen in different locations. And, um, I wasn't necessarily trying to change the location, but I was just sort of naturally focusing my attention in, in different directions and I happened to notice, uh, a switch from the location of, of the ring, from position A to position B.
- 51:33 RTH: Okay.
- 51:35 Phil: It's very vague. I mean, it's not like it's not like the, the ringing has a, a very clear source to it. I mean, it is just a general ringing, but there is also this spatial quality that I notice to it as well.
- 51:50 CK: And Phil, I noticed when you're talking about like the spatial, you're kind of gesturing to where it is, and I know there's a approximate location. Is that location, is this sound as if this is coming, like from outside my body in, or is this like in my head, y'know, like I know there is a location, but you know, like that, that location is somehow within me?
- 52:10 Phil: It almost feels like it's something coming from outside my body in. It, it, it, it, yeah, I've never thought of it that way, but I would, I would say that's fair.
- 52:26 CK: There are these approximate locations, and it's not just that I'm sort of hearing this in my head there's some, maybe something about this sort of coming from out, I'm hearing like an external sort of ringing, like something outside the source.
- 52:39 Phil: Yeah, but I don't know if it's just because you say that now, or if, if, because I was saying that I think in my description, I said that, um, different lo, different locations in and around my head.
- 52:58 CK: Okay.
- 52:58 RTH: Your original gestures were, I thought in, at least included the external, external surround.
- 53:08 Phil: Yeah. Yeah. I'm, I'm also, I could be, I could be biased by how I hear it right now. [laughs]
- 53:16 CK: Yeah, there's a, that's a pretty fine grained distinction so I'm not holding your feet to the fire there, but I figured some, y'know, if, if it was something that was salient then, y'know.

53:25 Phil: For sure.

53:25 CK: Yeah.

53:25 Phil: Yup.

53:28 CK: I'm good on, or, and is there anything else, Phil, in your experience at the moment of the beep?

53:39 Phil: No.

53:42 CK: Okay, then I think I'm good for this beep.

53:44 RTH: Me too.

53:44 Phil: Okay.

53:44 RTH: So do we wanna do this again or wanna do this again?

53:49 Phil: Oh, and that was just about right on one hour, okay. So that works well. Good.

53:52 RTH: Yup.

53:52 CK: Yup.

53:52 Phil: Um, yes. We wanna do it again. I, I would say, uh, Tuesday.