

TRANSCRIPT WITH COMMENTARY

Tristan

Tristan Interview 7

Below in black is a word-for-word transcript of the February 24 interview with Tristan that is available on YouTube at <https://youtu.be/7DHtZvPswio>. In green are comments about and explanations of the Descriptive Experience Sampling process. If you have corrections, suggestions, or questions, please post them as YouTube comments.

RTH = Russ Hurlburt

AG = Amber Goto

Tristan = Tristan

- 0:00 RTH: Good morning. So this is gonna be Tristan's seventh day, is that right?
- 0:14 Tristan: Sounds about right.
- 0:17 RTH: And anything we should be talking about before we look at beeps?
- 0:22 Tristan: Um, not on my part.
- 0:25 RTH: I don't think on my part as far as I can remember. So I'm ready to jump right in if everybody else is ready.
- 0:33 Tristan: Alright.
- 0:33 RTH: Let's do it.

SAMPLE 7.1 DISCUSSION STARTS HERE

- 0:35 Tristan: Beep 1. Um, I, um, as a matter of fact, am on the website Reddit. Um, I am seeing the word and icon for the subreddit Soccer. Um, I am recognizing the familiar icon and the word, um, but there's no inner speech or voicing. Um, I am feeling a sort of affective anticipation of the pleasure of clicking on the link, is another component. So I'd say those are two components so far. And then the third component is I have a diffuse bodily anxiety, um, about a, um, that's, there's a, somehow related to, uh, setting up a film screening, um, something it, I'm thinking wordlessly here, but it's something along the lines of, uh, *did I get the time right? Is this gonna all get messed up?* Uh, and it's related to the person I'm texting with not being competent, and being frustrated, frustrating to work with.
- 2:14 RTH: So in that account, are there three things basically going on in your experience, seeing the icon and a pleasant anticipation of that and, uh, diffuse bodily anxiety? Or is, I guess that's two things. And then the third thing, which I guess I'm not sure about, should we separate out the seeing of the icon and the pleasant expectation? Or does that seem like sort of one thing?

- 2:43 Tristan: Mm. Um, yeah, they seem a little separate because in the seeing the icon, there's the recognition of, of just, of the word Soccer. So this was like, I'm recognizing this word. Um, yeah, I would, I would separate those out, but again, I, y'know, who, who really knows.
- 3:11 RTH: [mutes self and sneezes] Excuse me, I sneezed and turned off my, mute, muted, so you didn't have to hear that. But, uh, pretty, pretty good sized sneeze allergy season, I guess for me. Sorry about that. Okay, so you were saying that it seems like it's sort of a separate thing. The seeing and recognition is one thing and the plus an expectation is another.
- 3:31 Tristan: Yeah. I mean, it might be part of the same thing. You, maybe it's, I I, I don't really know how to differentiate. Um,
- 3:43 RTH: Okay. And, and, and then there is the diffuse bodily anxiety. [Tristan: Yeah.] And, and,
- 3:53 Tristan: Which is, which is also a cognitive anxiety, actually, so.
- 3:56 RTH: So, so let's start there. So does this seem like I am mostly cognitive? *I'm thinking, did I get it right? Is she gonna mess up, she's not competent*, whatever. All that's, those all seem like sorta cognitive deals. And is that what I'm calling anxiety? Or do I have a bodily sense of those things which is...?
- 4:27 Tristan: Um, well, to describe it, I would say that as a matter of fact, I have been having, uh, just been bombarded with these cognitive thoughts about, about how this thing is gonna go wrong. And at the moment of the beep, um, those are all present, but I'm not thinking about one particular aspect of those thoughts. It's just sort of like an overwhelming state of being, I guess. So it's, it's certainly an anxiety, it's certainly bodily, it certainly has a cognitive component. As I'm thinking of all these things that could go wrong, I just can't look at any which particular thing at this exact moment, um, I am thinking about.
- 5:20 RTH: So I guess what I'm trying to figure out, and, and I'm not sure that this is the right, right question to ask, but anxiety is generally described as in sort of an affective thing, and the being bombarded by a bunch of thoughts seems like sort of a cognitive thing.
- 5:35 Tristan: Right.
- 5:37 RTH: And so does this seem, does this seem like sort of fundamentally a cognitive thing or a fundamentally an affective thing? Or, or doesn't that question just make, it just doesn't make sense there're so intertwined or whatever?
- 5:54 Tristan: Well, I would, I would say that in my, y'know, I don't necessarily know if I would make that separation for myself between it, as far as differentiating those things. I would say at the moment of the beep, it is, um, I, at the moment of the beep, it is maybe a little more on the affective than the cognitive realm, but I wouldn't necessarily make that separation.

6:26 RTH: Okay.

6:26 Tristan: Does that make sense to you?

6:30 RTH: I, I think so. I'm, I'm, I'm, I'm trying to sort it through. And so I think that help, helps us, helps us. And, and diffuse bodily..

6:42 Tristan: Right.

6:42 RTH: What does that mean in this, for this beep?

6:46 Tristan: Well, it just means that I think I've had enough anxiety in my samples at this point, right, this kinda all I, I all kinda say diffuse bodily anxiety for all of them. Um, it's I would say at the moment of the beep, I wouldn't be able to locate the anxiety in one specific part of my body. But if you made me think about it, I would say I have pain in my stomach. I have pain in my neck. I have pain in my head, I have pain everywhere. But at the moment of the beep, I'm not, I wouldn't say those particular bodily pains are at the footlight of my consciousness, but if you would ask me to locate where my feeling is, I would say that the feeling of stress is somehow, y'know, I feel a, something in my stomach, I feel a something in my... Y'know, I would, I would, if you asked me to locate it at that moment, I would, I would, I would point you towards specific places. But in the footlight, footlights of my consciousness, I just feel, uh, I diffuse bodily anxiety.

7:58 RTH: So it's *not* fair to say it's *not* bodily.

8:03 Tristan: Right.

8:03 RTH: It's *not* fair to say that it's specifically in any particular point of my body.

8:08 Tristan: Right.

8:11 RTH: And it's *not* fair to say that it's *not* cognitive, but it's also not fair to say that it's *just* cognitive.

8:18 Tristan: Right.

8:23 RTH: And so that makes it seem like the whole experience, the whole, as this whole aspect of it is something like diffusely cognitive, diffusely bodily diffusely....

8:36 Tristan: Yeah. It sounds, sounds right.

8:40 RTH: Okay.

8:44 Tristan: Is, that is my, is my confusion of categories unusual for samples? Do you find that I'm resistant to being straightforward in my categorization here?

- 9:01 RTH: I don't, I I don't think I'm, I'm, I don't think I'm smart enough to answer that question. I'd answer it if I could, but, uh, the. I, I would, I would, well, lemme, lemme put it this way and answer to that question. I would say some people are quite clear about things, and they would, they would say, *y'know, I was having a visual image and this is what I was seeing.* And somebody else would say, *I was innerly speaking, and these are the words that I was saying.* And other people would say, *I was thinking, and it was pretty clear to me what I was thinking, but I wasn't thinking it in words.* Some people are clear like that, and some people are not. And, uh, you're at the *not* end of that spectrum, I would say. These kinds of spectrum, these kinds of things. And, and, and I'm just trying to figure it out, that's the....
- 10:00 So the, so the *fundamental* question is something like, Is Tristan's experience just like everybody else's experience, but he has a, a way of talking about it, which makes it seem sort of diffuse? Or is his experience actually quite different from people who don't use, wouldn't occur to them to use the word *diffuse*? Maybe this is a verbal thing for Tristan. I don't think that's the case, but I'm open to that as a possibility. And so I would say that's why we have to do this project multiple times is that, that we have to sort of learn how to speak in ways to each other that we know what we're talking about.
- 10:47 So there's the, so that's the second half. The first half of this was, I'm seeing the word in the icon *soccer* of a sub, of a subreddit.
- 10:57 Tristan: Right.
- 10:59 RTH: And does that mean I, I see it and I recognize this is the Soccer subreddit, and I'm looking forward to going to going there. But it isn't like I'm saying to myself, "aha! This is the soccer subreddit," and it's just,
- 11:14 Tristan: Um, well, it's, I see it and it's on a big page and it jumps out to me that the, the word "Soccer." So I'm, I'm recognizing that word. Um, and I'm also recognizing the icon. And I, I would say if we're putting numbers on it, that's probably the most prominent thing in my experience. Um, and then I would say that there's also an affective side is that I'm anticipating clicking on it and anticipating pleasure, or experiencing pleasure from... No, probably anticipating pleasure once if I click on it.
- 11:56 RTH: Okay. And when you say the word Soccer jumps out at you, does it jump out at you as a word "soccer," or does it jump at you as the meaning of the soccer subreddit?
[Tristan: Um,] um, the sign signpost that I'm going to?
- 12:12 Tristan: As a word "soccer."
- 12:15 RTH: So if I'm driving down a freeway and I see a green sign with white letters that says "Los Angeles," I think I would be thinking of that as something about the, this is the distance from here to Los Angeles, but I *wouldn't* be thinking about the *word* Los Angeles. I would be thinking about how far I am from Los Angeles.
- 12:36 Tristan: Hmm. Um, I would say that I, in this case, am thinking about, or I'm, I'm recognizing the word "soccer," and that recognition is, yeah, is part of definitely the, the word that pops out.

12:55 RTH: So it's the *word* "soccer," not the meaning or the lexical significance, semantic significance of soccer. Is that right? It's the word? [Tristan: Yeah.] It's the word itself? Okay. [pause] Then I think I'm good about that. Amber, you have any additional questions?

13:27 AG: Um, no, I think I feel good about that too. And I just wanted to, but I wanna double check about the, the anticipation. This is like an, we said it's an affective emotional anticipation of pleasure, or this is an affective emotional pleasure?

13:43 Tristan: Uh, anticipation of pleasure.

13:46 AG: Got it. Okay. Got it. Then. I'm good.

13:53 RTH: Alright. Number 2, which would be Amber's word. [AG: Mm hmm.] Amber's beep.

SAMPLE 7.2 DISCUSSION STARTS HERE

13:58 Tristan: Okay. Um, I am in the process of reading what I have written, um, and am thinking about what to write, that's sort of just background. Um, I am looking at and recognizing the word "interoception." Um, and I'm simultaneously thinking about the phrase "assuming a body." Um, and I am also thinking about, I'm trying to put, I'm trying to put something into words, so I'm trying to summon the correct words. Um, and I'm feeling, uh, some anxiety about this.

15:14 AG: Okay. So is this, um, three or four things?

15:23 Tristan: "Interoception,"

15:26 AG: Assuming I hear the interoception, the "assuming a body" phrase thing, the trying to summon the words and anxiety, or is the anxiety and trying to summon the words one?

15:39 Tristan: Uh, I think we could say anxiously trying to summon words.

15:53 AG: Okay. Okay. And of these three things, which is the most salient in your experience? The most prominent?

16:07 Tristan: Um, the, trying to summon the correct words.

16:13 AG: Okay. So I'm anxiously trying to summon the correct words. How is that present in your experience?

16:24 Tristan: Um, uh, let me try to think about it and not describe, try to describe it in some poetic way. It's present in, I've got this word I'm looking at, I've got this, this sort of phrase that's in my mind, but I'm trying to reach for something else that's not those, I'm trying to reach for something that I don't quite have yet.

16:50 AG: And I take it this reaching is like a metaphor of like a cognitive. It, well, am I getting that right? Is there some kind of, is that a metaphorical reaching or is there like a cognitive?

17:00 Tristan: Yeah, that's a, that's just a metaphor.

17:03 AG: Okay. So I'm somehow cognitively, is this a cognitive process? I haven't asked that.

17:09 Tristan: Yeah. Yeah.

17:10 AG: Okay. So I take it I am somehow cognitively reaching for something that isn't there yet, or words that aren't there yet?

17:25 Tristan: Yeah. [AG: Or I,] yeah.

17:31 AG: And is this, I hear that there's this, like, I'm anxiously reaching for it, but is there some kind of, um, process that that's, that's happening? Is this like a, like I under.... I guess what I'm trying to ask is, is this this like a series of thoughts? Like, it's not like I'm going through a list of things, I'm saying this or that, or is it just I am, I understand myself to be reaching for something that isn't there or, yeah.

18:04 Tristan: Well, it, it sorta, I think that would take me beyond the precise moment of the beep for, for example. [AG: Okay.] Because I mean, in this process I am, there might have been a visual image of like a blind man's cane before. There's like, words are starting to come to mind. Um, at the moment of the beep, I can't necessarily say, y'know, I'm just trying to find something, I'm trying to pick out the right word. Try to summon the right word. Um, trying to summon the right thought to put in the right order.

18:40 AG: Okay. And at the moment of the beep, is that in words or images?

18:48 Tristan: Um, no.

18:50 AG: Okay. Um, Dr. Hurlburt, do you have any more questions about this part? [pause] Um, you're muted.

19:13 RTH: The anxiously reaching. We haven't talked about the anxiety portion of this.

19:19 AG: Okay. Yeah. Uh, are you good on the other part?

19:22 RTH: Yeah.

19:22 AG: Okay. So in terms of the anxiously reaching, how is the anxiousness part present to you?

19:32 Tristan: Um,

19:36 RTH: So that question made it a little more separate than I think it had to have been.

19:36 Russ comments: RTH here refers to AG's 19:22 question, where she has nounified ("anxiousness") what has until now been an adverb ("anxiously"). That is, she has made a separate thing out of what has been an aspect.

19:39 AG: Yeah.

19:41 Tristan: Y'know, maybe, I mean, I'd say this whole, this whole cognitive process, there's an element of anxiety, but the anxiety is just kind of a constant bodily feeling through this. So maybe, maybe that's why, y'know, I could say "anxiously reaching." I could say "there's a fourth diffuse anxiety." So I, I dunno I feel like I could go either way on that. I would, I would just say that there, y'know, it's kind of hard for me to separate out anxiety.

20:24 RTH: And, and is it hard to separate it out, or is it sorta hard to feel it at all? It's like, it seems like it's there, but can't really feel it.

20:37 Tristan: I mean, I could definitely feel it.

20:40 RTH: And, and how, how do you I, feel it, what does that mean? "I definitely feel it." I'm not disbelieving you, I'm just trying to understand what I'm guessing this is gonna be in the diffuse anxiety, diffuse bodily situation.

21:00 Tristan: Yeah. Diffuse bodily anxiety. Yeah.

21:10 RTH: And it's there diffusely bodily, but not specifically bodily?

21:18 Tristan: Right.

21:24 RTH: Hmm. And, and I, I guess I wanna be clear that it, this is, it's *not* the case that I understand myself, my self-concept, my Tristan-concept is *I feel anxiety all the time*, and therefore, I must say at every, any given time, "well I'm anxious here too."

21:48 Tristan: No. It's, it's not a self-concept.

21:51 RTH: So it's a direct apprehension?

21:54 Tristan: Mm hmm.

21:54 RTH: Of something which is so far more diffuse than we've been able to, [Tristan: Right.] or we haven't, we haven't been able to specify it any more specifically than to say *diffusely bodily*.

22:09 Tristan: Right.

22:11 RTH: Okay. Okay.

22:18 AG: Okay. Um, now we've got the, the phrase, "assuming a body."

22:32 Tristan: Mm hmm.

22:32 AG: How is that present in your experience?

22:36 Tristan: Um, uh, that is present, um, in my mind, but I'm not specifically, I'm not innerly voicing it or hearing it. It's just in my, it's just a word I am, it's just a phrase I'm thinking about.

22:58 AG: And when you say, I'm thinking about this phrase is this, I am thinking about the meaning of the phrase, or I'm thinking about the "assuming a body," and it's those three words that are there, and that's it.

23:14 Tristan: It's the three words.

23:19 RTH: So my experience is not so much I am thinking *about* "assuming a body," but rather I am *thinking*, "assuming a body."

23:19 Russ comments: This is in reaction to AG's (22:58) "or I'm thinking about the 'assuming a body'." That is, AG's "the" makes her question a meta-experience reference: there is the phrase "assuming a body," and then there is (meta-wise) the thinking about that phrase. RTH thinks that meta-perspective is now warranted, which he actuates by removing the word "the" from AG's question.

Said another way: DES is about directly apprehended experience. The question RTH (and AG) are trying to tease apart is whether Tristan's experience *is* the phrase, or whether his experience is somehow a *consideration of* the phrase. Either way, there may well be some not-directly-apprehended cognitive process underlying the directly apprehended experience, but DES is not concerned with non-experienced things that might or might not be taking place below the surface.

23:29 Tristan: Right.

23:30 RTH: Okay.

23:31 AG: And the words are present?

23:34 Tristan: Yes.

23:35 AG: But it's not spoken, heard, or anything like that, they're just there?

23:42 Tristan: Right.

23:45 RTH: And is it *w*, *words* that are there, or *that phrase* that is there?

23:49 Tristan: The phrase.

23:53 RTH: And if one were to, if one were to speak that phrase, "assuming a body," it would take a second to unroll it.

23:58 Tristan: Mm hmm.

23:58 RTH: Does that, is that unfolding or unrolling or whatever present to you? Or is it just this whole thing, this phrase, just is there?

24:10 Tristan: It's the whole thing.

24:18 RTH: Okay. I'm good about that portion. Then there's the "inter, interoception" portion.

24:21 AG: Okay. So now this looking and recognizing "interoception," um, how is that present in your experience?

24:30 Tristan: Um, I would say it's, I'm visually recognizing it, um, and recognizing it as a word without, without innerly voicing or hearing. Um, and without much, I wouldn't say I'm, I'm recognizing it with comprehension.

25:00 RTH: You *are* recognizing it with comprehension.

25:03 Tristan: Yeah.

25:06 AG: So it's not just that I'm recognizing the word "interception." There's something, it, it takes like a step further than just the word being there. Is there something about the meaning of it too, or like the definition of the word? I guess?

25:06 Russ comments: AG's question mischaracterizes what Tristan has said. The good news is that Tristan's upcoming turn corrects the description.

25:23 Tristan: Um, I wouldn't be able to disentangle that. I would just say I am recognizing with comprehension.

25:32 AG: Okay.

25:35 RTH: And does, does that make this somewhat different from the *Soccer* of the previous beep, or is it really the, sorta the same.

25:43 Tristan: With the rec, recognizing with, um... [pause] There, there's an element of says it's i, iconicity to the Soccer that's different from here. Whereas there's more of a visual component of like, something on the screen I recognize that well has has different affordances, but let's just say, let's just say to make this clear. Um, it's not dissimilar, I guess. I dunno.

26:33 RTH: It's not just similar. Is that what you said?

26:36 Tristan: Um, no, let's say that the, the comprehension that there's more, I don't wanna kind of complicate this, but there's something, there's something to do with seeing that word and looking for other words. Like it's somehow involved in that process.

26:58 RTH: We talking about synchronicity or soccer here?

27:00 Tristan: Uh, [AG: Interoception.] interoception.

27:04 RTH: I, yeah. Interception or interception or,

27:07 Tristan: Yeah. Interception is somehow in, in, I, I don't know. It's, it's involved in this process.

27:14 RTH: So does, so lemme tell you how I understand this at the moment, or were you tell me whether this is on the track. *Soccer* has a sort of a pointer-ness to it of an icon, and interoception has a semantic nature, part of a part of a semantic consideration.

27:40 Tristan: Yeah. That's, that's good.

27:43 RTH: But they're both present as words.

27:46 Tristan: Mm hmm.

27:49 RTH: Not primarily even the interoception, not primarily present as its meaning. Is that right?

27:54 Tristan: Correct. Yeah.

27:56 RTH: Okay. Okay. And I think I'm good.

28:06 Tristan: Me as well.

28:08 RTH: Number 3.

SAMPLE 7.3 DISCUSSION STARTS HERE

28:11 Tristan: Alright. Number 3. Um, I am, uh, as a matter of fact playing chess, um, I am visually, uh, recognizing the position. I'm anxious about my chess position. Um, and I'm, it's, it's very difficult for me to describe what exactly is going through, it's, I'm thinking about in relation to the position at the exact moment of the beep. But I'm sort of running through visual positions and possibilities in my head, sort of imagining thinking of how to defend my back rank; thinking, imagining my knight moving backwards. Um, yeah. My knight, imagining how my knight moving backwards will not defend it properly. So I'm sort of in a process of cycling through these, um, uh, these sort of visual possibilities, as well as, yeah, mostly visual possibilities, um, which have an affective component of *these are all, none of these are good*. Um.

29:52 RTH: So I'm cycling through a bunch of visual possibilities at the moment of the beep. I'm not sure which one I'm at. Is, is that right?

29:58 Tristan: Right.

30:02 RTH: Is, is that right?

30:03 Tristan: Yup, that's right.

30:05 RTH: Okay. And, and what does "visual possibilities" mean? What...?

30:11 Tristan: Um, for example, I'm looking at my screen and I see the knight in one square, but in my mind's eye, I am imagining the knight moving backwards to capture another piece, um.

30:27 RTH: And, and so by that, does that mean that I innerly see, imaginarily see, whatever you wanna call that, my knight [Tristan: Yeah.] having moved backwards?

30:37 Tristan: Yeah. I, I'm, it's, it's innerly. I'm not looking at the screen and seeing my knight moving on the screen. It's, it's innerly. Yes.

30:46 RTH: And, and, and, and clearly? And I, I see this new position of my, my knight innerly clearly?

30:57 Tristan: Mm, [pause]

31:00 RTH: So lemme, lemme back away from that same question a little bit. So do I see just the knight or do I see the board with the knight in this new position? Or doesn't *that* question even make sense?

31:13 Tristan: Like, I am running through multiple possibilities at the same time. So.

31:22 RTH: Multiple *visual* possibilities?

31:26 Tristan: Yes.

31:28 RTH: And I would like to know what *visual* means in "visual possibilities."

31:34 Tristan: Um, that some are more visual and some are, well, let's just say, let's just say I'm seeing the board and I'm innerly mostly seeing the knight moving positions on the board. So I'm seeing in actuality in front of me, the board, and I'm innerly seeing, um, just the knight moving backwards to capture another piece.

32:11 RTH: And do I see the knight in motion? So when you say, "I see the knight moving backwards," do I see the knight *moving* backwards or do I see the *result* of a motion? [pause]

32:28 RTH: What do what I really want, maybe I should've just asked more, more directly. In this visual, in this inner visual experience that you, that so far we've called "inner visual." What exactly do you see? And so it could be that, that there is a *hint* of visualization somewhere that I, that I recognize this is a knight having moved; or it could be that I see the new fragment of the board. I see the board with the knight on it. I see it clearly in the black squares and the white squares or whatever; or neither one of those things.

33:06 Tristan: It's that in my, I innerly see, um, I innerly see the knight. Um. I see it's moved from one chess piece to another,

33:25 RTH: From square to another?

33:27 Tristan: Mm hmm.

33:28 RTH: And, and do I what, when you say "I see the knight," what does, what does that exactly, does that mean?

33:39 Tristan: Well, the knight is a little, little icon. So I'm seeing, I'm seeing that same icon move backwards to a different square.

33:50 RTH: So this is not so much like I see a three dimensional standing- up-on-a-chess-board knight, I see a square with a, with the knight icon.

34:01 Tristan: I'm seeing the same squares I'm looking on the screen, and I'm seeing the same knight icon that I'm looking at on the screen.

34:07 RTH: Okay. And, and when I say I see it innerly, does that mean that I see it on the screen out there on the computer, or does it mean?

34:16 Tristan: No, no.

34:16 RTH: Okay.

34:16 Tristan: It's separate. It's inner.

34:19 RTH: And, and do I see the chess board as well, innerly? Or is it just the knight?

34:28 Tristan: Um, it's the chess board is there, but kind of more vague. It's not like I see everything on the chess board. It's like I see, um, I see a sorta chess board, but I mostly just see the knight moving from one square to another.

34:50 RTH: Okay. And do I see the, in, in my inner inner imagination? Do I see the knight clearly?

35:00 Tristan: Um, mm. [pause] ummm.

35:05 RTH: So the alternative to that would be something like, well, I sorta hintaly see, or I, I see something that I know to be the knight, or I don't actually see the knight at all, but I re, understand myself to be visualizing it, even though I don't see it. There's a whole lotta range, whole range of possibilities that could be. Trying to figure it out.

35:26 Tristan: I, um, [long pause] I, I see it's sort of semi clear. [RTH: What,] It's sort of, um, [long pause] it's, mm, kinda hard to answer.

35:26 Russ comments: This discussion of innerly seeing the knight highlights the difficulty of DES (and any other attempt to describe inner experience). There have been times in

this discussion where Tristan has seemed to describe clear seeing confidently (e.g., 33:39 “Well, the knight is a little, little icon. So I’m seeing, I’m seeing that same icon move backwards to a different square”). But there are other times where his description of the clarity with which he innerly sees is not at all confidently described (e.g., 35:26). What should we make of that?

Many DES participants describe inner seeing with absolute clarity and confidence (see Kerry, for example). Some people deny ever innerly seeing (see Mel, for example). Careful interviewing (you can see for yourself whether you agree) of Kerry and Mel convinces me that they are faithfully describing very different inner experiences. Where does Tristan fit in on that experiential continuum? I think we don’t know. We will have to examine several or many experience across several or many sampling days.

- 36:18 RTH: So I’m, I’m totally capable of answering questions that are not possible to answer. So, so I, I, I’m, I recognize that’s part of the game that we’re playing here.
- 36:28 Tristan: Let’s just say of, of uncertain clarity [inaudible because RTH coughs].
- 36:36 RTH: And does, it would be possible in some worlds to make a distinction between seeing clearly something which is unclear, unclear itself, like in the real world, I, and it’s foggy or dark or something, and my, I, I’m seeing clearly, but what I’m seeing is foggy. *Or* it could be that the *seeing itself* is just not clear, I’m.
- 37:08 Tristan: Uh, it’s not quite clear how much of the knight itself I’m seeing, um, since I’m, since it seems I’m cycling so quick through different possibilities.
- 37:08 Russ comments: Note that Tristan has provided an explanation (things are too quick) for unclear seeing. That explanation may be correct, but instead it may be a reasonable-sounding but not actually faithful explanation. I think it is not possible to make the distinction about the present sample—at the moment of the beep Tristan was not practiced enough to grasp his unclarity. Perhaps, if inner seeing occurs on some future sampling day, the present conversation will sensitize him to potential nuances, and he may be more able to grasp with fidelity. That is: perhaps the iterative nature of DES will help us out.
- 37:39 RTH: So the, what I’ve got, I guess, is at the moment of the beep, in some visual way, I am cycling through the possibilities of where I could move my knight, mostly backwards to protect the last rank,
- 37:56 Tristan: Um, of how I, of how I could defend my back rank, including moving the knight backwards.
- 38:08 RTH: So it’s mostly about defending the back rank rather than moving the knight?
- 38:14 Tristan: Um, yes, I see the, I see the rook moving to the back rank, and I am imagining my knight moving backwards to take it.

38:31 RTH: And are those sort of separate things? I see the, the knight moving *and* I see the rook moving on two separate seeings, or does that?

38:40 Tristan: It's the same actually. Yeah. The knight, the knight's moving backwards to capture the, to capture the rook. Sorry, I just made this more complicated.

38:55 RTH: Well, I think this might be the first time we've tried to describe a inner visualization.

39:03 Tristan: Right.

39:04 RTH: And, and what we're discovering is that there's some polishing of the technique to.

39:11 Tristan: Yeah. I, I think there might've been one or two others, but I guess not too many.

39:18 RTH: Okay. And there's some anxiety about these. And is the anxiety about this particular move and then another anxiety about that particular move? Or is there an anxiety about, I'm in danger here, losing my?

39:37 Tristan: The anxiety is, is something about *none of these moves are good*.

39:44 RTH: Okay. And is there a way to describe how that anxiety is present?

39:50 Tristan: Um, uh, I would describe this as a more cognitive anxiety. Uh, in that its its bodiliness isn't as much present to me at the moment. I'm just sort of, um, uh, I'm just sort of cycling through a lot of possibilities at the moment. And I'm not satisfied with any of them. And I feel like I'm going to lose.

40:48 RTH: [long pause] So the, what makes this job difficult, possibly impossible, certainly interesting, is to try to d, try to determine what, what we mean by all these things.

41:04 So the word *cognitive* is something of a problematic word for me. I use it a lot cuz the, cuz I don't, there aren't, there aren't too many better words. But the problem with cognitive is that cognitive can refer to a process that has nothing to do with *experiential*. That's the way some cognitive psychologists use the term most, mostly all the time. They're referring to some analytical process that takes place in some number of billions of neurons outside of awareness. And then there's cognitive, as we sometimes use the word that where we, where we understand ourselves to be experientially engaging in a analytical kind of a process. So that, *that* meaning of cognitive is definitely *experiential*, I.

41:56 And then, then when it comes to feelings, well there is, there is the experience of anxiety, which does *not* involve bodily aspects. A lot of people report feeling anxiety that, and say there's absolutely no bodily thing here. And they generally use terms something like *mental*, this, this anxiety is mental as opposed to bodily. It's anxiety, it feels like anxiety, every bit is anxiety as if, as if it were in the body. But I don't feel it in my body. So I call that *mental*. And I don't mean that to mean *cognitive*, I mean that it's, this is a *feeling* of anxiety. It just is, doesn't have any bodily aspect. And then there's anxiety, which, which it seems like it's possible that, and, and some of your situations that I, what I, what I actually do is to, I experience a series of quickly moving non-satisfying mental thoughts. This is a cognitive directly experienced

thought, and then another cognitive, directly experienced thought, and then another cognitive experience thought in a sequence or a swirl or an overlapping, or a combination or a simultaneity or something. All these things are mostly cognitive. And that feels like anxiety to me.

43:30 Tristan: Um, well, that was, I mean, I would say that definitely feels like what I feel, but it's not just that I'm, that sort of makes it seem like that the anxiety is epiphenomenal to the, to the sort of quick succession of, of thoughts. Um.

44:02 RTH: I don't, I think epiphenomenal might be a little bit too extreme for me.

44:10 Tristan: I mean, I definitely feel like I have a lot of, I of, um, anxious thoughts, mental thoughts. Um, but, um, [pause] Wait, so, um, so let's, be, beyond theorizing about, about how this could work. So what, what parts about my experience do you want me to be more clear about, or provide insight on right now?

44:55 RTH: [pause] So there in some usages, not necessarily yours, but in some usages, *anxiety* refers to a feeling that has no cognitive / analytical pieces to it. [Tristan: Mm hmm.] I feel anxious, sorta a free floating thing. I feel anxious. It's not like I'm thinking about something, but... I don't experience myself as thinking about something, but I do experience myself as feeling anxious.

45:29 Tristan.: Mm hmm, I.

45:29 RTH: And I have, I haven't heard you say that. I think what I've heard you say is something like, I'm thinking about this and I'm thinking about that and I'm thinking about this other, and maybe the same thing, maybe related, I also could say I'm anxious.

45:50 Tristan: Um, I mean, I would say, I would say I, I wouldn't necessarily know how to disentangle the mental from, from the, from the thought, from the, from the anxiety. Only in this particular case, it seems more mental than, for example, my past samples, since it's so much wrapped up in just the logistics of it's, um.. Yeah, this is, this is the one example where I would less focus on the, the bodily. I mean, I, I think even when they're bodily, it's all, it's mental as well. But, um, but this is just more, I'm anxiously that's why I said I'm, I made it one thing and this one is just I'm having anxious thoughts about my chess position. Um.

47:00 RTH: Okay.

47:03 Tristan: Yeah.

47:04 RTH: And then I guess to return to the visual, what, what I'm remembering that we ended up with about the visual portion is it's inner, I don't superimpose these moves on the outside screen. It's visual, but it's inchoately visual, or it is not fully articulated visual.

47:35 Tristan: Right. That, that sounds good to me, yeah.

47:46 RTH: Okay. And quick, quickly, in succession?

47:49 Tristan: Right.

47:50 RTH: And somehow tinged with anxiety?

47:53 Tristan: Right.

47:56 RTH: And whether that anxiety is the result of a quick succession of unsatisfying visualizations, or whether it is its own separate or separable feeling that accompanies that (maybe the result of maybe whatever), that's sorta hard for us to say.

48:21 Tristan: Right, right. Sure, it, it seems sort of integral. It's, it's, I mean, well, let's, that sounds, that sounds good. That sounds good.

48:32 RTH: Okay. And am ready to for number 4.

48:36 AG: Um, I wanna ask one more question before we go on.

48:38 RTH: Sure.

48:38 AG: So the visually recognition, I think at the very beginning we said that there was a visual recognition. Is that just the inner piece? Or is there also something else with that at the moment of the beep?

48:53 Tristan: Oh, there's also the, the visual recognition of, of what my position is on screen. So I'm looking at the position of all the pieces and I'm sort of have a comprehension of them.

49:07 AG: So I take it, this is like a, I'm seeing it on the screen like a, I guess an outer, for lack of a better term that I can think of.

49:15 Tristan: Yeah, yeah. [AG: Okay.] Sorry if I forgot to make that clear. I'm, I'm outer, I'm outerly seeing the chess pieces on the screen.

49:23 AG: Okay.

49:25 Tristan: And I'm, I'm using that to form the inner, the inner visualization.

49:31 AG: Okay. And when you say recognizing my position, does that mean that they are focused on any particular piece or like focused on the formation of my pieces, or something like that? Or is it just, is that just a way of saying I'm seeing it.

49:49 Tristan: I'm seeing it.

49:51 AG: Okay. Then I'm good. Unless you have any more questions.

49:54 RTH: I'm good. Number 4.

49:55 AG: Okay.

49:58 Tristan: Alright. Well, we don't have that much time for four, I guess. I guess we could give it a go. I'm just tired. Okay, so I'm, I'm, as a matter of fact.,

50:07 RTH: So, so we could, if you're, we could call it a day if you like, or we could, we got seven more minutes in our hour, but we don't have to go the whole, whole hour.

50:18 Tristan: Um, let's, let's call it a day.

50:20 RTH: Okay.

50:20 Tristan: If you're fine with that.

50:24 RTH: I'm fine with that. So shall we figure out when we're gonna do this again?

50:30 Tristan: Sure um..