

TRANSCRIPT WITH COMMENTARY

Tristan

Tristan Interview 6

Below in black is a word-for-word transcript of the February 17 interview with Tristan that is available on YouTube at <https://youtu.be/wJVAlYPfbPA>. In green are comments about and explanations of the Descriptive Experience Sampling process. If you have corrections, suggestions, or questions, please post them as YouTube comments.

RTH = Russ Hurlburt

AG = Amber Goto

Tristan = Tristan

00:02 RTH: Good morning.

00:02 AG: There we go. I think that's working now.

00:07 RTH: Good afternoon, or whatever it is. I guess it's afternoon for Tristan.

00:12 Tristan: Yes.

00:13 RTH: And I'm recording if that's alright with everybody.

00:17 Tristan: Alright.

00:20 RTH: And anything that we should be talking about before we start [Tristan: Um.] our conversation about the beeps? I did, I did send Tristan a clarificatory email [see the note at the end of Tristan interview 5] to make sure that I understood what we were talking about, about the experience of reading. I think I copied Amber about that on that email. And Tristan responded and said basically he had, he agreed with what my understanding was, I understood.

00:50 Tristan: Yeah.

00:52 RTH: Which isn't surprising, but that's like the, like, to make sure I get things right, and, uh,

00:57 Tristan: That's good to clarify.

01:01 RTH: So anything else we should be talking about before we?

01:06 Tristan: Um, I, I'm ready to jump in.

01:08 RTH: I'm ready. Let's do it. Number 1. This is, so this is day 6, maybe?

01:13 Tristan: Day six. Um, ye, I suppose. Yeah.

01:19 RTH: Alright. Number 1.

SAMPLE 6.1 DISCUSSION STARTS HERE

01:23 Tristan: Um, so the components are that, as a matter of fact, I'm looking at a lamp on Amazon.com, and I was thinking that the li, it was a nice lamp. I liked the design. Um, I was wondering how much it cost. I, and I was feeling like I had to poop. And I had a stomachache.

02:14 RTH: So I, by my count, there's like four things going on here. As a matter of fact of the universe, I'm looking at the ad; and the things that are in my experience are something like, it's a nice design, and how much it costs, and I have to poop, and, uh, stomachache.

02:34 Tristan: Yeah.

02:35 RTH: And is any of those more prominent than?

02:42 Tristan: Um, the thinking about the lamps design. Oh, there might be a, yeah, as part of that, I like that it was gold. Um, actually maybe that's still, maybe that's part of the same thing as liking, liking the lamp, but I specifically, I liked that it was gold.

03:03 RTH: Okay. And is that the most prominent part of your experience?

03:10 Tristan: Yeah, that's the most prominent.

03:11 RTH: By a lot, or by just edging out some of the other ones.

03:16 Tristan: Um, so I'd say the bodily stuff is like maybe 10 to 20.

03:26 RTH: Each or total?

03:28 Tristan: Um, total. Uh, the, how much it costs is 20, and the rest is just thinking about liking the lamp.

03:37 RTH: So that's like the bulk of it is thinking about the lamp. 6, 60 ish or something like that. Yeah. 60, 70. So let's start there. So, I like the lamp. I like the design of the lamp. I like it's gold.

03:51 Tristan: Yeah ac,

03:52 RTH: So is the... Go ahead.

03:55 Tristan: Oh, I was just gonna say that there were no words attached to this. This is just wordless thought.

04:04 RTH: And, and by "wordless thought," do you mean that you understand this as a *cognizing about*, I feel I understand myself to be cognizing that I like this. That's a nice design?

Or am I attracted to the nice design and the goldness? And that's not necessarily cognitive, but sensory attraction.

- 04:31 Tristan: I would, I would say, I would say it was cognitive.
- 04:33 RTH: Both the gold *and* the design?
- 04:36 Tristan: Yeah.
- 04:38 RTH: So it's not so much that I'm attracted to the gold, but that I think, I analyze the gold to be pleasant or something like that. Is that right?
- 04:50 Tristan: Yeah. Yeah.
- 04:51 RTH: Okay.
- 04:52 Tristan: Like, I like that it's gold instead of, instead of... Well just say, I like that it was gold, but I like the design sort of mid-century modern. Um, yeah. So, so I, I I would say it's a, it's a cognitive process without words attached to it.
- 05:14 RTH: Okay. And by process, do you mean experienced, directly experienced? I experienced myself to be *cognizing about*, not that I theorize myself, well, I must be cognizing because I'm distinguishing this between that, this and that, or whatever. That would be sort of a theoretical view of my processes. The question is whether that's what I'm saying when I mean, when I say *process*, or whether I am experiencing myself as analytically or cognitively or?
- 05:44 Tristan: I, I, I experience it.
- 05:47 RTH: Okay. And so there's, *I like the design. That's a good design, a pleasant design*. But that's a thinking, a thinking thing. I *think* it's a good design, not, I'm just attracted to the design. *And* I am satisfied, analytically satisfied that it's gold, or I like that it's gold or?
- 06:15 Tristan: Mm hmm.
- 06:15 RTH: And are those, are those separate deals? Or is it that I am somehow cognizing that the lamp is good, pleasant, whatever. And when you ask me to tell you about it, well, it's that the design is good, the color is good.
- 06:31 Tristan: I'd say they're the same thing.
- 06:35 RTH: So I am cognitively apprehending the desirable qualities of the lamp.
- 06:42 Tristan: Yeah, that's good.
- 06:45 RTH: And when I, when I articulate the details of that, it's design and color, gold, gold color, and maybe, maybe some other stuff too, but that's sorta primarily it.

06:59 Tristan: Yeah.

06:59 RTH: But this, I'm thinking about the, the visual features, I guess you would say, of the lamp.

07:06 Tristan: Mm hmm.

07:12 RTH: And, and this, this is a positive thing. I, I like them, approve of them, in favor of them. Is that right?

07:25 Tristan: Yeah.

07:27 RTH: But my experience is more of a cognitive thing rather than an *affectively drawn to* or a *sensory drawn to*.

07:37 Tristan: Um.

07:40 RTH: I'm not trying to talk you into that, I'm just trying to.

07:42 Tristan: Yes, yeah, i., i, it's more of a cognitive thing.

07:47 RTH: Okay. Then I think I'm happy with that portion.

07:49 AG: Yup, me too.

07:51 RTH: And then there is, I'm wondering about how much it costs.

07:58 Tristan: Yes.

08:02 RTH: And that, well, you tell me. What, how does that come to you? How does that, how do you apprehend that?

08:11 Tristan: Um, it's coming to me because there's a lack of the visual element of the cost on screen. And I feel like I need to know how much it costs.

08:24 RTH: So the first part of that sounded sorta like an explanation. This is *why* I'm thinking about that.

08:30 Tristan: Yes, so.

08:31 RTH: And is that present to you at the moment, or is it just, I am wondering how much it costs, and when Russ asks me about it, I'm telling him, well, this is why?

08:41 Tristan: Uh, I think it's the second.

08:44 RTH: Okay. And the *how much does it cost* is, uh, cognizing about, I experienced myself as wondering, what's this gonna, what's this, this cost?

08:56 Tristan: Yes.

08:56 RTH: And are there words involved?

08:58 Tristan: No.

09:00 RTH: Okay. And is this, so we've got *two* things that we have sort of bluntly called *cognizing* here. One is the appealing design / color of the lamp; and the other is how much it cost?

09:13 Tristan: Mm hmm.

09:14 RTH: Are those the same kind of cognizing, or are those that were two different kinds of experiences that we're using the same word for?

09:27 Tristan: They're the same kind of cognizing.

09:30 RTH: So I have a cognitive, analytical, experiential wondering, and a cognitive experiential analytical appraisal of the desirable colors and shape?

09:48 Tristan: Yeah.

09:48 RTH: And those seem like sort of the same thing to me.

09:52 Tristan: Right.

09:54 RTH: Okay. But separate?

09:56 Tristan: Separate, yeah.

09:59 RTH: Simultaneous, simultaneous processes that seem similar.

10:04 Tristan: Right.

10:05 RTH: Okay. Any questions about that, Amber? [She shakes her head] And then there is, I have to poop.

10:14 Tristan: Yeah.

10:14 RTH: Is is that directly present to me at this moment?

10:17 Tristan: Yes.

10:18 RTH: In what way?

10:21 Tristan: Bodily sensation that I'm feeling like that's my, a bodily sensation.

10:31 RTH: And bodily interior sensation, bodily a, anal sensation. At what, what kind of a bodily sensation are we talking about?

10:40 Tristan: Well, I would say interior.

10:45 RTH: So it's not like I'm holding it back. It's like I am feeling a pressure or something of the...?

10:53 Tristan: Well, let's say it's just difficult for me to describe whether it's internal or external. And it's actually probably a bit of both.

11:01 RTH: Okay. And located?

11:06 Tristan: Anus and colon, I guess.

11:08 RTH: Okay, so.

11:10 Tristan: Sphincter.

11:10 RTH: Lower than the stomach?

11:13 Tristan: Yeah.

11:13 RTH: In the, in the tract. Okay.

11:15 Tristan: Yeah.

11:16 RTH: And, and is, is this a sensory thing? I "sensate" this?

11:26 Tristan: Yeah.

11:27 RTH: Okay. So this is not the same then as the appraisal of the color, which I gathered was *not* primarily senso, sensual but mostly cognitive. This is mostly sensual and not much at all cognitive, is that right? I'm not trying to talk you into that. So this could be a, I'm, I'm thinking kind of a deal, I have to poop.

11:53 Tristan: No, no. This is, this is almost exclusively sensory.

11:59 RTH: Okay. And then there is the stomachache

12:02 Tristan: Mm hmm. And that's also sensory as well.

12:05 RTH: And what does that feel like?

12:08 Tristan: That feels like? Um, I would say it's an interior, it's an interior pain in the stomach.

12:25 RTH: Okay. And is that separate from / related to / the same thing as the *I have to poop*?

12:34 Tristan: Uh, yes, separate.

12:36 RTH: Entirely separate?

12:36 RTH: Mm hmm.

12:36 RTH: This is one sensation, that's another sensation. They're both bodily. They're both sort of in my thorax, but not the same thing.

12:48 Tristan: Yeah.

12:52 RTH: And do they seem like, I asked about the first two, and you said they seemed like the same process, even though the content was different. One was color and the other was price. Now I wanna ask the same thing. Is, is this, these are both sensations and one of them is stomach-y and the other is anus-y?

13:14 Tristan: Yeah. The, I mean the, there's similar, similar process happening, different parts of the body, separate.

13:21 RTH: But you experienced them as being more or less the same realm of [Tristan: Yeah.] same, same kind of sen, same type of sensation. That's a question.

13:32 Tristan: Yeah.

13:35 RTH: Okay. Then I think I'm good, unless Amber's got additional questions?

13:38 AG: No, I think I'm good as well.

13:41 RTH: Alright. Let's go on to number 2.

13:43 AG: Okay. Beep 2.

SAMPLE 6.2 DISCUSSION STARTS HERE

13:44 Tristan: Alright. So in beep 2, I'm thinking about the word "gold." So the word "gold" is present to me. Um, uh, and I'm feeling anxiety over finding the correct word, uh, and over whether figuring out whether I was thinking in words or not. So, so this is, as a matter of fact, this sample was taken while I'm trying to write up the previous sample.

13:44 Russ comments: DES often skips samples where the experience is of writing about the previous sample, on the logic that it may be too complicated to try to keep the two experiences separate. Here we continued because it seemed Tristan was keeping the two experiences pretty distinct.

14:28 AG: Okay. And is there anything else?

14:33 Tristan: Um, that's it.

14:34 AG: Okay. Okay. So I hear there's a couple of things going on here. Um, is there anything that's more salient in your experience, or are they both about the same?

14:52 Tristan: Um, I would give them equal weight.

14:56 AG: Equal, okay. So I'd like to start with the "gold" part.

15:04 Tristan: Mm hmm.

15:04 AG: How is that present in your experience?

15:08 Tristan: Well, I would say that I'm thinking about the word, so I'm cognizing about the word "gold," and it's present to me, but there's nothing especially speech-like or hearing-like about it. I'm just thinking about the word.

15:27 AG: Okay. And that word, I hear, I'm thinking about the word, but is that word there?

15:45 Tristan: Yeah, the word is there, somehow; the word "gold" is, is there.

15:50 AG: Okay. So, and by cognizing, this sounds.

15:59 RTH: So, so, so before we go down that, that road, [AG: Okay.] can I ask a more basic question?

16:02 AG: Sure.

16:02 RTH: So is this, or am I thinking *about* the word, or am I thinking *the word*? So the question is, is what is what is in my experience just "gold?" I'm thinking the word "gold" somehow. Or am I somehow thinking about the word, whether it's a noun or whether it's the right word, or whether it's.... So am I thinking *the word* or am I thinking *about the word*? Or doesn't that question make sense?

16:40 Tristan: Uh, I would say both.

16:46 RTH: Okay. And, and my question is experiential.

16:48 Tristan: Mm hmm.

16:48 RTH: So then I'm not asking about what, what you, I'm not asking, I'm *not* asking you to speculate about the process that leads to why I would be thinking about this or whatever. I'm just about what, what is directly apprehended.

17:10 Tristan: Yeah. It's, it's, it's both because I'm thinking the word, but I'm also thinking *about* the word.

17:21 RTH: Okay. And is one of those more salient to you, the *word* or the *about the word*? Or is are those wrapped up in the same deal?

17:28 Tristan: They're wrapped up in the same thing.

17:30 RTH: Okay. Then Amber, I'm happy to have you continue on there. (You're muted.)

17:41 AG: Um, so I wanted to get a sense of how the thinking about the word process is present to you at the moment of the beep.

17:41 Russ comments: I have two reactions to that question. First, Tristan has said that the two aspects are the same, but AG's question has asked about just one aspect. Second, she has inquired about the *process* (which is presumably outside of awareness) when DES is interested only in directly apprehended experience.

17:58 Tristan: Um, it's present to me because it's, um, wrapped up in my, it's present to me because it's somehow related to the anxiety I'm feeling at that moment.

18:16 AG: Hmm. Okay. So I guess the word "because" is a little problematic for me. I'm trying to figure out, so is this thinking about the word, tied into the word, and the anxiety? Or is it somehow, or is that, I guess I'm trying to make sure that that's not like a, a theory about anxiety or...

18:45 Tristan: Right, right, right.

18:45 AG: ...how that's present.

18:47 Tristan: Not making it a theory. Um, I would say I'm thinking about the word "gold." Um, and I'm also feeling this anxiety. And I wouldn't necessarily say I'm feeling anxiety *about* this word. So, so these things are, are a little separate to me still. I just know that I'm thinking about gold *and* I'm feeling this anxiety.

19:31 AG: Okay. So if I understand that correctly, all of this is about the same thing, but the experience.... Like contextually, it's all about the same thing, but experientially, these are separate processes. Am I getting that right? The thinking about anxiety and the anxiety and the, I mean, sorry, the thinking about "gold" and the feeling anxiety,

20:01 Tristan: Um, um, I'm not sure it's about the same thing, but I just know that they're closely related.

20:18 AG: Okay.

20:19 RTH: So, so can I ask another clarification question [Tristan: Uh huh.] before we get too far down here. So when I say I'm thinking about the word "gold," does that mean I am trying to decide whether "gold" is the right word? I could use "brassy" or I could use "lustrous," or I could use "not silver" or whatever. So this is just a word choice deal? Or is it I am I am trying to get this right. I want I, in which, in which case it's more, more about Tristan, I guess: Tristan wants to be right? Or is it the, the word aptness. So I guess my question is, am I, am I aiming at the word, or I aiming at Tristan wanting the word to be right?

21:15 Tristan: Um, well, I would say that, um, if you go forward or backwards in my sample, I may have been thinking something more specific about the word "gold," but where, where we are at right before the beep, I just know that I'm thinking the word, I'm thinking about it, and I have this sort of general anxiety related to finding the right words, but not necessarily related to... It's not spec, I'm not specifically anxious about the word "gold," but I have this anxiety about finding the correct words.

21:56 RTH: Okay.

21:56 Tristan: Does that make sense? Does that?

21:59 RTH: It does. Thanks.

22:03 AG: Okay. I think I've got the thinking part. I don't have any more questions about the thinking part. Um.

22:13 RTH: So lemme see whether I understand that, then. So is my, is my experience: I am thinking the word "gold." So there's not too much question here that the word "gold" is present to me, not spoken, not heard, but nonetheless, before the footlights of my conscious "gold" is present.

22:29 Tristan: Mm hmm.

22:29 RTH: And it is a matter of my understanding is that I'm trying to find the right word. But I'm not analyzing myself as trying to find the right word. What I am is feeling somewhat anxious *about* finding the right word.

22:52 Tristan: Mm hmm.

22:54 RTH: Okay. That's the way I understood it.

23:02 AG: Okay. Um, and I know we said that on the outset, we said cognizing, sorry, we said the word "gold," then thinking about the word, and *then* feeling anxiety. I just wanna make sure that we've now all understood that the feeling anxiety, is this trying to find the right word thing? Or is it separate than that?

23:35 Tristan: Oh yeah, that, that's the same thing. [AG: Okay.] It's, it's a feeling this anxiety over trying to find the right word *and* trying to determine if in the previous sample I was thinking in words or not.

23:48 AG: Okay. And this is, is this, this sounds like a emotional affective-y thing.

23:59 Tristan: Um, I would say it's both emotional / affective as well as part of a mental process.

24:12 AG: And by mental process. That sounds like kind of like a...

24:16 Tristan: Maybe I'm overcomplicating, maybe let's just say it's emotional / affective, um.

24:21 AG: Well, if it's somehow both, I would like to, I'd like to know about that. I wanna make sure I'm understanding fully, right. [Tristan: Yeah.] We could call a mental or a cognizing process, um, y'know, emotional *and* cognitive, or whatever. I just wanna make sure that I'm fully understanding how this is going for you and how it's present.

24:45 Tristan: Okay. Then maybe, maybe, maybe it's both.

24:49 AG: Okay.

24:50 Tristan: I'd say it's both.

24:52 AG: Um, and okay, so I take it that the, I wanna start with the emotion side cuz I don't think we talked about that enough. How is that present in your experience, this emotional anxiety?

25:22 Tristan: [pause] Um, I, I'm, I'm not sure how to answer that.

25:29 AG: Okay. I mean, um, like is this, I, this sounds to me, by the way we've been talking about it, that this is *not* a bodily deal. Is that correct?

25:44 Tristan: Um. [pause]

25:51 RTH: So I would say I haven't heard that. So could be or could, might not, could or be or not be.

25:56 AG: Yeah.

25:56 Tristan: We have been talking about that distinction in the past. Um, and I, I'm still, I'm still a little unsure about whether it's bodily or not.

26:13 AG: Okay. So at this moment of this beep, we can't really say whether the anxiety is bodily or not bodily?

26:23 Tristan: Well, I'm just unsure how to do it without, without delving into theories over what anxiety is for me.

26:31 AG: Okay.

26:31 Tristan: Theorizing, [AG: Okay.] if that makes sense.

26:34 AG: Yeah.

26:35 RTH: Well, can I help, can I help about that? So if there, if there is a bodily sensation involved at the moment of the beep, then [Tristan: Right.] then that would be fair game. Then we could theorize I suppose about whether that bodily sensation was a part of the anxiety or not—that would be a different story. But, but I think it's, I think it would be possible to be saying, "I'm feeling anxious" and at the same time I am feeling something bodily. My heart is racing, my stomach is knotting, my hands are

sweaty, whatever. All those things could be there in, in my experience. *Or* they might, none of those things could be there. In which case I would say, well, this did not directly appear to me to be bodily. So it's not theoretic, it's, from my point of view, it's trying to describe experience without theory.

27:29 Tristan: Right. I would say that if it's bodily, it's not localizable. Um, but yeah, I, I I would say it's not, not especially bodily.

27:56 RTH: Okay. So the non localizable bo, like, localizable to me seems like, well, that could be theory. My, my theory of anxiety says that if I got anxiety, it's gotta be bodily. *Or* it could be that there's something that *seems* bodily, but it's so diffuse that I can't nail any aspect of it. Or I'm not too sure about any of that.

28:23 Tristan: I, I would say that's it. I would say it seems bodily, but it's too diffused to define in terms of any specific bodily part.

28:32 RTH: Alright. And not, and able to diffuse, and able to define at all in my head, in my chest, in my, not in my arms, in my feet, not in my feet. Can't say it's just, there's some tincture of bodily something it seems, but I can't say where.

28:54 Tristan: Yeah.

28:56 RTH: Okay. So if I put a drop of food coloring into the bathtub, the water turns pink and I can't say where it's pink, but it seems like it's sort of pink. Is that the [Tristan: Yeah.] metaphorically what we're talking about here.

29:16 AG: Okay. Um, now I just would like to dive a little bit into the cognitive side of this portion.

29:27 Tristan: Mm hmm.

29:28 AG: Um, so how is that present in your experience?

29:37 Tristan: Is that I'm trying to, uh, uh, I'm trying to figure something out. So I am, I'm actively working on figuring this out. So as well as there being an anxiety, there's, I am also there, y'know, playing, playing, y'know, I'm, I'm trying to work through a cognitive process, basically.

30:10 AG: So I'm trying to, I'm trying to work through a, so that I'm trying to work through the cognitive process of finding?

30:21 Tristan: I'm trying to find if, if I was thinking in words or not, or if I was writing the correct word.

30:29 AG: Okay. I guess what I'm trying to figure out is like, I, I'm a little confused because it sounds like that's what we had described earlier, kind of.

30:46 Tristan: Right.

30:47 AG: So is that separate, different?

30:53 Tristan: From the, from the anxiety?

30:56 AG: Uh, like earlier we had talked about, I'm trying to find like this process of trying to find the right word. And is this the same thing as that portion of experience? Or is this separate?

31:14 Tristan: Oh, no, no, that's the same thing as, as before I guess.

31:17 AG: Okay. And I'm not trying to talk you into that. I just wanna make sure that I got that correctly.

31:24 Tristan: Right, right.

31:26 AG: Okay. So trying to find the right word *and* is there a word present or something?

31:36 Tristan: Yeah.

31:38 AG: And that's not, *that* is *not* in words.

31:43 Tristan: Right.

31:43 AG: But if we have, but when we to *describe* it, those are the words I'd put to it.

31:48 Tristan: Right, right.

31:58 AG: Okay. Okay. Um, so let me make sure I've got this correctly. Um, so at the moment of the beep, the word "gold" is this present to me, not spoken, not heard, but it's there. *And* I am feel there's this anxiety thing, it's emotional and cognitive. The emotional part seems bodily, but diffuse throughout the body. Can't really say where it is, and I am, and tied to that, correct?, is this trying to find the right word, is there a word there? Process going on?

32:53 Tristan: Yup.

32:54 AG: Did I get that all correctly?

32:56 Tristan: Okay.

32:57 AG: Okay. And is there anything else in your experience at this moment?

33:03 Tristan: That's it.

33:03 AG: That's it? Okay.

33:07 RTH: I'm good.

33:07 AG: Me too.

33:08 RTH: Number 3.

SAMPLE 6.3 DISCUSSION STARTS HERE

33:12 Tristan: [long pause while Tristan surveys his notes.] Um, I, um, so the word, the phrase “shows how” is present to me (because I’m reading it). Um, I’m feeling anxiety, overthinking about how much I have to read. Um, and I’m conscious of myself flipping between different pages of my book.

34:48 RTH: So three things present to you in, in your experience?

34:51 Tristan: Mm hmm.

34:52 RTH: The word shows, words “show how,” show phrase “shows how”; feeling anxiety; and the flipping of the pages.

35:01 Tristan: Right.

35:02 RTH: So the flipping of the pages is not merely context. That’s experiential?

35:06 Tristan: Yeah.

35:07 RTH: And of those three, is one of the more prominent?

35:13 Tristan: Um, equal.

35:15 RTH: Okay. Well let’s do ‘em in the order then that we talked about. So the, the phrase “shows how” was present to me. Am I reading with comprehension? And, and I guess I mean that both in a, in a process way, is it a fact of the universe that I’m reading with comprehension? And also experiential, do I understand, [Tristan: Um.] do I feel myself to understand what I’m reading at the moment.

35:40 Tristan: Yes. I’m, as a fact I’m reading with comprehension, um. “Shows how” is the last thing I, I’ve read. So it’s not like something that’s stuck to me as I’ve continued reading. That just happens to be the last thing I’ve read. Um,

35:58 RTH: So this is not a *latches onto* “shows how” this is, uh, last words that I’ve read “shows how”?

36:06 Tristan: Yes.

36:07 RTH: Okay. So in the drawing that I sent you yesterday, this would be a type I experience?

36:14 Tristan: Yeah. It’s my type I.

- 36:16 RTH: Okay. So if, if I were to put that into English, I would say something like: I'm reading with comprehension and the beep comes as I read the word "shows how," which is the last thing, and that interrupts my reading. Is that right?
- 36:32 Tristan: Yeah.
- 36:32 RTH: Okay. And *then* I am feeling anxiety. And what does that, how does that present itself?
- 36:46 Tristan: Um, the anxiety is involved in a cog, cognition of, um, this thinking of how much I have to read and to understand. Um, that's how I would put it into words, but I wasn't necessarily thinking with those words. Um, and there's also something diffusely bodily about it.
- 37:17 RTH: And the cognitive portion, *how much I have to read*, whether or not that's in words, is that present to me as part of this anxiety?
- 37:26 Tristan: Yes.
- 37:27 RTH: So the, the analytic, the, (there's gotta be a better word, but I dunno what it is). Cognitive analytic portion of this is present to me as *part of* the anxiety.
- 37:27 Russ comments: RTH may be somewhat out ahead of Tristan here. Tristan had said (36:46) "the anxiety is involved in a cog, cognition of, um, this thinking of how much I have to read and to understand." One possible understanding of that is (as RTH says at 37:27) that the "cognitive analytic portion of this is present to me as *part of* the anxiety." But another possible understanding is that the cognitive portion *is* the anxiety—that is, that Tristan uses the word "anxiety" to describe a critical / disapproving cognition. RTH does not explore that option. I'm not claiming that that is the *correct* option; I'm merely noticing that RTH has deprived us of the opportunity to discover whether that is the correct option.
- 37:38 Tristan: Yes.
- 37:40 RTH: Okay. And then there is a diffuse bodily. And, and by "diffuse bodily," do we mean it seems like there's something bodily, but I can't pin it down to any particular part of my body, and yet it also doesn't seem like it's not bodily.
- 38:06 Tristan: Yes.
- 38:12 RTH: Okay. And so is, does that make it the same diffuse bodily as in the previous, the previous beep over? what word to select?
- 38:20 Tristan: Yeah.
- 38:22 RTH: So the anxiety seems somehow bodily, even though I can't say what portion of my body it's in?

- 38:22 Russ comments: It is still possible that Tristan's presuppositional theory of anxiety asserts that all anxiety is bodily, and that presupposition is what has driven the reports here and in sample 6.2. That is, if Tristan believes that anxiety *must be* bodily, then he may say that his anxiety is diffusely bodily even though he can't pin it down to a particular region. Note that RTH brackets this possibility—he does *not* confront Tristan or push the presupposition explanation; there is nothing to be gained by trying to talk someone out of a presupposition (presupposition is a form of delusion). He has tried for a careful description, and across occasions, the iterative procedure may shed some light on this issue.
- 38:30 Tristan: Mm hmm.
- 38:38 RTH: Okay. And then, so I'm happy with that portion unless Amber's got more about that. Then, then I'm flipping pages and what's that? What about that is in my experience?
- 38:53 Tristan: Well, I would say I'm doing it and as a matter of fact, and I'm also aware of myself doing it, cognitively.
- 39:10 RTH: And, [pause] and I guess I wanna know what "aware of myself cognitively" means. So does that mean that I, that there's a part of me that is in a cognitive, analytical way, noticing that Tristan is flipping pages, recognizing, recognizing that Tristan is flipping pages? So it's not just I'm flipping pages, but I am somehow cog, cognizing / noticing / recognizing the flipping?
- 39:53 Tristan: Well that makes it sound maybe a little more passive than it is. It's, I am, I guess it is it, it's I've, I, I'm flipping pages, and um, or maybe, maybe let, how, how would I phrase it differently, is, I'm, I'm flipping pages *with a purpose*, and I am noticing it experientially. I'm just, y'know, that's part of my experience.
- 40:51 RTH: So it's not merely about the pages being flipped, it's about the reason for, or the task of, or the analysis of the reason, the reason, the reason being, I guess, is somehow present to me. I'm flipping these pages [Tristan: Right.] for some, for something, and that, that for something is present to me.
- 41:18 Tristan: Yeah.
- 41:18 RTH: Okay. And, and I am reading at the same time as I am flipping?
- 41:36 Tristan: Yeah. I'm, I'm, I'm reading on one of the pages that I've flipped back to.
- 41:46 RTH: So does that mean that the actual mechanical flipping of the page is *just past*? Or does it still seem—so the, the, the experiential world does not have to match up with the, with the physical world. So it could be that in the physical world, the page has flipped back and now I am reading that page; in the experiential world, it's possible that I still experience myself as doing the flipping, *even though* in the physical world I have, it's would be more accurate to say "has flipped."

42:22 Tristan: I would say I probably flipped like just a fraction amount of time beforehand, and I had my fingers between two different sections. So I still had my thumb and finger in, they were not adjacent pages, let's say they were quite a few pages in,

42:41 RTH: Few pages apart. So I've flipped this leaf, sheath of pages back and I'm now reading, but I'm still holding onto the pages, so it still makes sense to say I'm flipping back and forth.

42:54 Tristan: Right.

42:55 RTH: Even though at the moment of the beep, the pages are stopped, but I'm holding on to the batch of pages that I have flipped.

43:04 Tristan: Right.

43:05 RTH: Okay. And, and does the flipping and the anxiety seem like they're related to each other? Or is they, they seem like sort of separate things. I'm flipping and reading and feeling anxious as three separate processes.

43:31 Tristan: I'd say they're three separate things that are [inaudible].

43:35 RTH: And in the real world, they're no doubt related in some pro, procedural way. I got a lot to read. I'm flipping back and forth, I should read this or whatever. But as far as my experience is concerned, they seem like sort of three separate, separable deals.

43:51 Tristan: Yeah.

43:57 RTH: And does the flipping seem like a mechanical thing? I, I feel my hands, fingers, whatever do in the flipping? Or does this seem like a conceptual: I'm going to a different section of the book.

44:19 Tristan: Hmm. I would say both.

44:27 RTH: And bodily, which put fingers, arms, eyes, hands, not possible to say?

44:39 Tristan: Hands and fingers, I guess.

44:42 RTH: Okay. So this is *not* so diffuse. This is a bodily sensation of flipping in my hands and fingers.

44:56 Tristan: Yeah.

45:04 RTH: And, and I wanna make sure that, that we haven't let the self-theory into here. The self-theory would be something like: well, I'm flipping the pages; I'm doing it with my hands; therefore I must be paying attention to my hands. I'd rather us not do that. I'd rather have it say, well, I, that was not part of my experience. I was flipping the pages. Of course my hands were doing it, of course. But my experience is not of my hands.

It's of the pages being flipped or the jumping around. Actually it's more of a jumping around in the book.

45:59 Tristan: [long pause] Um.

46:01 RTH: And if it's not possible, it's not possible. So I'm per, I'm perfectly capable of asking questions that are not possible to answer.

46:07 Tristan: Yeah. Let's, let's leave that aside. It seems to me that there's something, that, there's an awareness of the whole apparatus there, but I, it's not quite possible to tease apart.

46:21 RTH: Okay. Then I think I'm good.

46:29 AG: Me was well.

46:29 RTH: Number 4.

SAMPLE 6.4 DISCUSSION STARTS HERE

46:33 Tristan: Okay. Um. [looks at notebook] So, uh, I'm coming across the word "resoluteness" and it's present to me. It's more like panel one [see the note at the end of transcript 5], where it's the last thing I read, um, as you sent me. Um, I am, uh, anxious because, for, because this is sort of what my thinking is, but it's not in these exact words, but it's because what I'm reading seems useless, or because, um, I could get, uh, it's, it's not worth the effort I'm putting into it. Um, and, uh, then I am also, uh, conscious of my anus cuz it feels cold and wet.

47:59 AG: Okay. So I wanna make sure I got this correctly. Are, do I hear like three things, or are these four things?

48:13 Tristan: Three.

48:14 AG: Three, okay.

48:15 Tristan: The word, the [AG: Anxious?] anxiety, which is, which is cognitive and, um, diffusely bodily, [AG: Okay.] same as last samples. And then the last is the bodily sensation.

48:34 AG: Okay. And are these all present in terms of salience? Are these all present the same amount?

48:44 Tristan: Um, the first two, the, the word and the anxiety are more present.

48:50 AG: Okay.

48:51 Tristan: The last one is like a 20 or 15 or something.

48:56 AG: Okay. So the last one is like, so if they say 20, then the others would be like 40-40?

49:02 Tristan: Sure. Yeah.

49:03 AG: Okay. Oops, okay. So let's start with the "resoluteness," "resoluteness"? [Tristan: Mm hmm.] Is that the word?

49:22 Tristan: Yeah.

49:22 AG: Okay. Um, so I hear that that's, I, I haven't, can't remember where the phrase we're using. I haven't like taken that out, or it's not stuck with me. Somehow it just happens. The beep happens to come at that word.

49:22 Russ comments: This is a reference to the "latched onto" interchanges in interview 5, which are summarized by the email at the end of interview 5.

49:40 Tristan: Yeah.

49:41 AG: Okay. So like, had it come a second after it would've been, I dunno, some it would've been something else and then it had it come before, it could have been a different set, a different word, or a different set of words. But right now the beep happens to come at "resoluteness"?

49:53 Tristan: Right.

49:54 AG: And as a fact of the universe, I am reading with comprehension. Is that right?

50:05 Tristan: Um, [pause] um, that's a little hard to say.

50:17 AG: Okay.

50:18 Tristan: That's, I can't say at this moment.

50:21 AG: Okay. Is that because somehow the reading is part of my experience? Or is it?

50:31 Tristan: Well, I'm, I'm attempting to read with comprehension, but sometimes (this is just speaking more broadly) sometimes I have to re-read.

50:40 AG: Okay.

50:40 Tristan: Uh, I get too distracted with other thoughts.

50:43 AG: Okay. I think, okay. So lemme clarify my question. What I'm trying to get a sense of is, is the, is I understand that I am in fact reading. Is anything about reading present in my experience at the moment of the beep? Or is it that the word "resoluteness" is just present there and it's present there because I am reading?

50:43 Russ comments: RE "Is anything about reading present in my experience"

That is basically a question about meta-awareness of reading, about noticing the characteristics of reading. Unless you intend specifically to inquire about meta-awareness, it is best to avoid questions that can be interpreted as meta-awareness questions.

51:11 Tristan: Um, I wouldn't say the fact that I'm reading is not present, but the, what's really most prominent is this word "resoluteness."

51:11 Russ comments: The first part of this answer is Tristan's wrestling with the meta-awareness implication of AG's 50:43 question. That wrestling could have been avoided had AG not asked a meta-awareness question.

51:23 AG: Okay. And how is that word present to you?

51:31 Tristan: Um, not especially spoken or heard, but um, seen and seen and present in a way.

51:45 AG: And by seen, does that mean like, I see the word outwardly? Or I see the word innerly? Or something else?

51:53 Tristan: So I, I'm, I'm outwardly seeing the word, and also the word as apparent in my comprehension, my cognition.

52:03 AG: And how is it apparent?

52:05 Tristan: Um, it just is.

52:11 AG: Okay. So somehow the word is, I'm seeing the word and I am also somehow, it, something's going on internally, I guess, with the word.

52:23 Tristan: Mm hmm.

52:23 AG: And is, I think I heard you saying earlier, this is not *especially* spoken. Does that mean that it is?

52:35 Tristan: No, no. There's, there's, there's not really a spoken or a heard quality to it.

52:40 AG: Okay. So the word is just *there*, not spoken or heard.

52:44 Tristan: Right.

52:53 AG: Okay. Okay. I think, you, [to RTH] do, do you have any more questions about that?

53:02 RTH: I do, I do. So is my experience of reading and the last word read is "resoluteness"? Or is my experience of the word "resoluteness," and as a matter of fact, it's the last word read? And the reason that I'm asking that is that you have referred to this pretty consistently as saying this as, aspect of my experience is the *word* "resoluteness," as opposed to I'm reading a sentence that's about the resoluteness of the Trump administration or something, and,

- 53:41 Tristan: Um, yeah, I think it's, I think it's my experience is I'm reading and the word "resoluteness" is especially prominent.
- 54:04 RTH: Okay. So in, in the picture that I sent you yesterday [see the email at the end of interview 5], this seems like sort of halfway in between. It's not like I have, I, it's not like I experienced myself as *latching onto* this word and then latching on to this word and then latching on to that other word, saltatory word latching, [Tristan: Mm hmm.] and yet it seems like I have somehow particularized this word, which happens to be the last one.
- 54:33 Tristan: Right.
- 54:34 RTH: Is that right?
- 54:35 Tristan: Yeah.
- 54:38 RTH: Okay.
- 54:46 AG: Okay.
- 54:49 RTH: Yeah.
- 54:50 AG: Okay. So then we have the anxious, anxiety, that feeling.
- 54:56 Tristan: Mm hmm.
- 54:56 AG: Um, in, on the outset, I heard this, there's a diffuse bodily piece, right? Like it's bodily, but I can't say where kind of throughout.
- 54:56 Russ comments: Because I have some skepticism about the bodily aspect of anxiety (see the comment at 38:22) I would have preferred this question to be more open-beginninged (e.g., "Could you tell me again about the anxiety?"). As it is, the question reifies the bodily, thereby making it more difficult to bracket what might be presuppositional.
- 55:10 Tristan: Mm hmm.
- 55:10 AG: And I also heard that there's this cognitive piece of what I'm reading seems not worth it or I can't get it, or something like that.
- 55:27 Tristan: Yeah. That, that's, I would say there's both a diffuse bodily-ness to the anxiety, which is less present. But what is more present is the, um, this cognitive process. [AG: Okay.] So it's, it's both an anxiety and a cognitive I'm *thinking* as well. But I, I guess when I wrote it down, I just, I start with the anxiety cuz it's very anxious thinking.

- 55:27 Russ comments: This is the penalty to be paid as the result of the reifying question (see the comment at 54:56). Tristan's 55:27 answer downplays the bodily-ness. That could be understood as his saying *it isn't really bodily but I'm going along with Amber*.
- 55:55 AG: Okay. So I'm anxiously thinking about what I'm reading is whatever.
- 55:55 Russ comments: RE "I'm anxiously thinking..."
That implies that there is anxiety, and out of this anxiety comes the thinking. That may be true, but it is also possible that there is the negative evaluation (what I'm reading seems useless) and there is another negative evaluation (it's not worth the effort) and there is another negative evaluation (...), and I apprehend that flurry of negative evaluations as anxiety. That is, it is possible that the negative cognitive reactions are the *result* of anxiety, or the negative cognitive reactions *are* the anxiety. AG's question does not leave equally open those possibilities. (At 37:27, I criticized RTH's question on the same grounds.)
- 56:05 Tristan: Yeah.
- 56:08 AG: And how is that present in your experience?
- 56:14 Tristan: That is present without necessarily words attached? Although there are, um, specific thoughts, like I'm thinking for example. Yeah, it's, it's, it's hard to locate at the exact moment of the beep what exactly it was that I was thinking, but there, there were it, yeah. But there were things I was thinking about, like.
- 56:49 AG: And by things you were thinking about, is it like just what I'm reading, like maybe it's not specifically the thought is what I'm reading feels not worth it, but it's somehow there is this thought process happening about what I'm reading?
- 57:05 Tristan: Yeah. [AG: Okay.] There, there is a thought process happening about what I'm reading.
- 57:13 RTH: Which it sounds like it could be characterized as being cri, critical or something.
- 57:18 Tristan: Yeah.
- 57:19 RTH: The, this reading is worthless, it's not worth the effort, whatever.
- 57:22 Tristan: Yeah.
- 57:23 RTH: And did, do those aspects seem like they're both present at the same time, or is it like first one and then another and it would be, it happened so fast, I can't tell the difference? Or does it seem like these are swirling around cognitions?
- 57:37 Tristan: Well, I feel like this would force me to make a theory that goes beyond the, the exact moment at the beep. But I, I would say that these, these various thoughts that I'm reading the wrong thing, that it seems useless, that I could get more from cognitive science reading rather than phenomenology, I would say that they're all, they're all

separable in some way. These, these are thoughts that are separable, that are occurring over the course of my thinking about this thing. But if when, when you stop me just at the moment of the beep, I can just say that I have this anxiety; I was thinking about, I was thinking something related to all this. Can't say exactly what.

58:34 RTH: And does the, does the thinking seem like the prominent aspect here? Like I'm thinking these, these critical thoughts [Tristan: Mm hmm.] which may or may not be entirely separable, not and, and, and are not in words, particularly. [Tristan: Mm hmmm. And so does it seem like I'm, I'm, I'm in the midst of this thinking stuff and I'm gonna call that *anxiety*? Or does it seem like I'm feeling anxious and when I have to tell you what this anxious is, it seems like it's sorta thinking stuff.

58:34 Russ comments: This is RTH's attempt to inquire about the possibilities sketched in the comment at 55:55...

59:14 Tristan: Um, it's more the first I'm in the midst of this thinking stuff and feeling anxious about it.

59:14 Russ comments: ...and Tristan's answer, while ambiguous, leans toward the *flurry-of-cognitions* = *anxiety* understanding.

59:24 RTH: Okay. And then when I think about telling you about the anxious stuff, then like, I could say, well, it seems like there's some diffuse bodily stuff as well, but that seems like rather distantly secondary to the thinking about the critical nature of this...?

59:45 Tristan: Uh, yeah. Yeah.

59:48 RTH: Okay. So that makes what we're calling *anxiety* here more a cognitive process than an affective process. Is that right? An indeterminately cognitive part ends up being anxiety? Or multiple, multiple undefined.

1:00:17 Tristan: I, I, I think it's both there. There's definitely an affective part as well.

1:00:22 RTH: That is, that is beyond just the swirl or presentation of these, these thoughts.

1:00:30 Tristan: Yeah.

1:00:32 RTH: Okay.

1:00:34 AG: Okay. Um, now the cold, wet anus piece, the bo, the, uh. Could you tell me how that's present in your experience?

1:00:46 Tristan: Sure. Well, as a matter of fact, I am on the toilet. Um, and I would say that this is a bodily sensation I am feeling at that moment. Um, more uh *less* interior, more exterior, um, and, uh, or on the skin rather, epidermal. Um, and, and yes, that's all I got.

1:01:18 AG: Okay. Um, I think I dunno. Dr. Hurlburt, do you have any more questions about that?

1:01:26 RTH: I think that's, I think that's good.

1:01:27 AG: Yeah, I think so.

1:01:29 RTH: And I am noticing that we are at our hour and, uh,

1:01:33 Tristan: Excellent.

1:01:35 RTH: So shall we, shall we do this again?

1:01:40 Tristan: Uh, sure

[They compare calendars]

1:03:11 Tristan: In that case, I will see you then.

1:03:13 RTH: Alright, sounds good to me. Thank you all very much.

1:03:16 AG: Thank you.