

Kerry U.
Kerry Interview 1

Below in black is a word-for-word transcript of the May 24 interview with Mel that is available on YouTube at <https://youtu.be/2NnLxk2pIW8>. In brown are conversations about the Descriptive Experience Sampling process that took place during the interview. In green are Russ's comments, and in blue are Julian's comments about and explanations of the Descriptive Experience Sampling process inserted after the interview. If you have corrections, suggestions, or questions, please post them as YouTube comments.

RTH = Russ Hurlburt

JBK = Julian Bass-Krueger

Mel = Mel May

Kerry = Kerry U.

JBK: 0:00 And now we can get into the, the first beep of the first day.

SAMPLE 1.1 DISCUSSION STARTS HERE

Kerry: 0:06 Yeah. We, um, we started off with a bit of a bang because I got a really bad bloody nose on the first beep, [laughs] [JBK: Mm-hmm.] which was super random. I used to, I like grew up getting bloody noses. And I, since moving out west, have gotten more, um, because of the dry air. But anyway, basically the way that I structured each beep, um, I did like a kind of, a little bit of a, a list in, in my phone. So I did *time, doing, moment, voice, visuals, physical*. And then as I went through the other beeps, I realized I also wanted to add *feeling*. So for the first one, the time was 8:43 AM *doing*, um, I got a bloody nose while washing my face with hot water. [laughs] Um, so I was leaned over the sink, yelling out for my housemate to please come, bring me toilet paper because I was nervous about getting blood on her carpet.

1:03 Um, the exact moment that the beep went off was I was, my housemate had just gotten upstairs and we were talking about why this might have happened and she was in the middle of suggesting that she gets light bloody noses when it's really dry out. Um, so in that moment, as she was saying that to me, um, what I was hearing in my head was my own voice asking questions of why this might have happened. So, am I dehydrated? Am I not drinking enough water? Is this because I'm running more? Or am I nervous slash stressed about this evening (cuz I was gonna like meet new people that evening)? Um, or maybe it's cuz of how hot the water was on my face. Like all these thoughts were kind of just going through, but I'm hearing them sort of like conversationally in my own voice. Um, *visuals*, nothing, nothing in my mind. And then *physical* was a bloody nose. So that's where I started [laughs].

JBK: 2:00 Okay. So you get this bloody nose, um, and you're talking to your roommate. This is the, the thing right before the beep. [Kerry: Mm-hmm.] And you're going through all these thoughts, um, if you're dehydrated or running too much or, or this or that. So,

um, so we still have a lot of options of what could be before, like directly before the beep at this moment. [Kerry: Mmm.] So I don't wanna, so I'm, I'm gonna list possibilities, but it could be something else entirely. Um, but you're, you're, you're kind of running through options and you mentioned a lot of them, like dehydrated, running too much, meeting new people, and nervous. [Kerry: Mm-hmm.] Are these, um, are these *all* right before the beep in the very first millisecond? And they could be, they could all be there, or it could be one of these things more specifically you mentioned, or it could be something else.

Kerry: 3:04 I think the, the actual moment of the beep was it cut my, my friend Amy off mid-sentence where she was saying, um, "I typically get them when it's really dry out." And while she was saying that I, I was kind of running through these questions in my mind. So like I can hear her speak, but I'm also hearing... these questions that I'm, I'm trying to work it out in my head. Is this also because it's dry? Is it because I'm running more or dehydrated? [JBK: Mm-hmm.] Um, so the actual moment probably would've been one of these many questions that I'm asking myself. [JBK: Okay.] Um, probably closer to, probably the dehydration one because she was mentioning "dry." So I feel like in that moment I would've been like, okay. But I was kind of rapidly cycling through all these.

JBK: 3:55 Okay. So, so you think it probably would've been just one of them? I don't wanna discount. It could be that, it could be that you have all of them at the same time, that's [Kerry: Mm-hmm.] I don't wanna discount that. It could be that they're so fast, it's like [flutters tongue], like one after the other. Or it could be that it's really maybe a, a couple seconds and one a couple seconds on the other. I, I don't think we'll be able to tell for this sample. [Kerry: Mm-hmm.] And that's just the, the first day, like, on other days you might be able to say, oh, it came really on this specific thought, the dehydration one. [Kerry: Right.] Or it came specifically on the nervous-about-meeting-new-people thought. So, so that might be something we'd be able to find out on different days. Um, I, I wouldn't push too hard on this day because I just think, I just think we, we all won't be sure. Um, so, so we have that.

3:55 Russ comments: Before Kerry had arrived, we had discussed that the first sample on the first sampling day is, for all concerned, by far the hardest part of DES. That is in general true, and this particular sample, because of its complexity and distress, is somewhat more difficult than the average first-beep-first-day sample.

DES is always a mixture of forward-looking iterative training (helping Kerry become more adept at describing the experience that was ongoing at future beeped moments) and backward-looking description (apprehending and describing what Kerry experienced yesterday at 8:43 AM). On the first sampling day, the iterative task is far more important than the descriptive task.

There are lots of ways that iterative training can take place, but perhaps the best is to help Kerry describe, in as much detail as she can, what was experienced at 8:43 yesterday, and *in the course of that describing for Kerry to realize (by her own assessment) that she doesn't know some important (by her own lights) details of that experience.*

I think JBK 3:55 short-circuited that opportunity, because it is more about possibilities generated by Julian than about description created by Kerry; and the

conclusion of not-knowing is stated by Julian rather than realized by Kerry. *Julian* advances possibilities of all at the same time, so fast like fluttering, or a couple seconds each. *Julian* concludes that we won't be sure. It would be better to help *Kerry* arrive at a tentative description something like *it was a few seconds each*, and then for *Kerry* to recognize *but I'm not sure—I'll have to pay closer attention to timing issues*.

Julian at 3:55 could have said something like: "Could you tell me more about this 'rapidly cycling' experience?" and then help Kerry describe that as best she can. Then he could follow her attempts with a warning about first beeps, and not to take first attempts too seriously. However, we never in this sample get to a concrete conversation about timing issues, and it is never clear in this sample that we have advanced Kerry's understanding of timing in general and the moment of the beep in particular.

JBK: 5:06 [continues] And then another thing I, I would like to find out more about, you say it's, it's your voice, you're talking to yourself, and I would wanna ask more details about that, but I, I think since we're not sure if it's one question or many of them, I, I don't want to ask specifics about that yet. [Kerry: Okay.]

5:36 Um, but I, I do wonder about the bloody nose, cuz you said you're experiencing this voice and physically you're experiencing this bloody nose. Do you think that's, are, is that physically or not necessarily physically? Is that present to you at this moment in your experience? Or is that just an action that's happening? So to make a comparison, like you're sitting in a chair now and you can feel that on, on your back probably, but um, before I turned your attention to it, it might've really just been background and not directly experienced. So do you, do you think the physical bloody nose part is?

5:36 Russ comments: The question that Julian is asking, I think, is whether the bloody nose is directly apprehended at the moment of the beep, or whether it is a fact of the universe. However, I don't think Kerry understands what "experienced" means, and Julian's attempts at differentiating don't turn out to be adequate. So I think for this sample we never reach an understanding of what we mean by experience.

From my point of view, we have not adequately advanced Kerry's understanding of the moment (see the comment at 3:55) or what is experience, and both are necessary for apprehending inner experience. And we do not make much or any progress on either front for the remainder of this sample's discussion.

As a result, Kerry will not focus her talk on (the DES technical term is *cleave to*, where to cleave is "to adhere firmly and closely or loyally and unwaveringly"; Merriam Webster) experience at the moment of the beep. As an exercise, I will indicate in green for each of Kerry's remaining responses my take on each. It will show that Kerry is not at all (or at best very minimally) aimed at directly apprehended experience at the moment of the beep. I emphasize that this is *not in the slightest* Kerry's fault. I think the interviewers did not adequately convey to Kerry what we wished her to do.

Kerry: 6:28 I think I understand your question. So are you saying, is the voice in my head tied to my physical experience in the sense that...? Actually, sorry, can you, can you repeat it? [She doesn't understand.]

JBK: 6:43 [laughs] Cuz you, you did a list, you, you

Kerry: 6:46 Yeah.

JBK: 6:47 The voice, and then I think you had a, a feeling or sensation part of that. And you said the bloody nose was the, the, the, the physical part. Is that, um, are you physically f, feeling something at this moment?

Kerry: 7:07 Um, yeah, I mean, like, I'm kind of, I'm, I can feel my feet underneath me. I can feel, um, like my hands and my laptop, stuff like that. But I'm not necessarily voicing those physical [She gives a generalized speculation.]

JBK: 7:19 Okay. I'm not asking if you're, if you're *voicing* it at the moment, but if you're, if you're physically feeling it in a way that's more present than just like right now, like your feet are touching the ground or something, but before I called your attention to it, it probably was just background.

Kerry: 7:41 Correct. Yeah.

JBK: 7:43 So, so is anything more than background? Uh,

Kerry: 7:50 Um, I occasionally get back pain that I would say is not like, that's more present and I'll think about it in response as well. Um, but I would say most things physically are background unless like a bloody nose kind of calls your attention. Um, [She gives a non-temporally-specific generality]

JBK: 8:06 But, but right before this beep specifically.

Kerry: 8:09 Mmmm.

JBK: 8:13 Or right at, at the beep, at the very millisecond.

Kerry: 8:17 At the beep, I think I was.... I mean at the beep I was leaned over the sink bl- [laughs] bleeding. So I was pretty present in that both mentally and physically. [She starts by trying to be temporally specific, but the second sentence is not at all specific.]

JBK: 8:30 So you leaned over the sink talking to your roommate?

Kerry: 8:34 Right.

JBK: 8:36 Okay. Um, so yeah, again, this is the first beep and we might, uh, find out more on other beeps, but it could be, y'know, for example, it could be like you leaned over the sink and your nose is bleeding. But right now what's really most in your head is just wondering why, [Kerry: Mmmm.] y'know, is it the dehydration? Is it... Or it could be you're running through reasons why, but also physically you can feel the blood coming out of your nose or something. So that's a distinction... Or that might not be relevant to you. But...

Kerry: 9:17 I think if my, the biggest things like leading up to the beep that were going through my mind were, I don't wanna get blood on this carpet in the bathroom [JBK: Mm-hmm.]

and , I wanna know why this is happening so it doesn't happen again. Those were the two main occupying sort of thoughts. And then in that exact beeping moment, I think I was leaning towards dehydration, just because Amy had suggested that. [She gives a generality.]

JBK: 9:45 Okay. So you think you're leaning towards dehydration? [Kerry: Mm-hmm.] Um, so I'm actually gonna ask a few more specifics on that because I said before that maybe we weren't sure if it was dehydration or if it was nervous about meeting new people or this or that. [Kerry: Mm-hmm.] But, but now I think, um, yeah, I would like to ask more about the dehydration. Could, could you say what that exact thought was?

Kerry: 10:24 Um, verbally in my mind it was kind of, am I dehydrated? Am I, am I running too much? I'm training; for context, I'm training for a marathon. Um, and I was told by someone that I need to be drinking [laughs] a gallon of water a day. So by saying like, am I dehydrated? It almost was like, oh, I'm not doing enough, y'know what I mean? I'm not doing what I'm supposed to be doing. [JBK: Mm-hmm.] Um, so I think that's like the context of the thought, but in that moment it was just more of a walking through a list of all these potential reasons. [She gives a series of non-specific generalities.]

JBK: 11:02 Okay. So, so it was a list of potentials, or you think dehydration was the latest one? Or is it maybe dehydration tied to running too much? Something like, am I dehydrated because I'm running too much?

Kerry: 11:15 Exactly. Yeah. I think all these reasons are almost overlapping in, I guess some broader context of like, um, the marathon, not drinking enough, and stuff and being kind of busy, um, to the point where I'm not, uh, training properly. And then that evening I'm meant to meet new people, so I was kind of, yeah, just running through I guess like contextually what it could have been. But dehydration was top of mind because of Amy's comment, which is the exact mo— she was, it, the beep cut her off mid-sentence. [She remains general, then speculates about causation rather than experience.]

JBK: 11:59 Okay. The beep, the beep cut her off. So she was talking. You mentioned that before she was talking and you had these thoughts going.

Kerry: 12:08 Yes.

JBK: 12:10 Were you also experiencing her talking? As in she, she is talking and we, you're processing that you're, you're hear, hearing what she's saying in some way, um, is, is what's most in your experience your own thoughts? Or also her talking? Or both?

Kerry: 12:36 I would say in that moment I was more, um, present and, and listening. But I will say more broadly, like I tend to almost like rehearse what I'm gonna say before I say it. So as you're asking that question, I was thinking of my response and I'm listening to you, I can hear you, but I also have a voice in my head thinking through what, how I wanna respond. [She tries to be specific but then becomes general/speculative.]

- JBK: 13:06 Okay. But I want us to stick to this beep specifically. [Kerry: Okay.] Because it might be different from how you generally [Kerry: Yeah.] like, or how you think you generally respond, y'know, if you're thinking of a response or not. Um, but when you're running through lists of why you're dehydrated, uh, or sorry, of why your nose might be bloody, maybe it's your dehydrated. Is, is that more in terms of how to respond to her? Or is it more just wondering why your nose is bleeding?
- Kerry: 13:43 I think it's more wondering why out of a worry that it's going to happen again. So trying to get down to the root cause so that if it is dehydration, I can drink more water and then this won't happen again. [She speculates about causation.]
- JBK: 13:59 Okay. So could be motivated by that. Um, alright. So I, I think I'll, I'll turn it over to Russ and Mel now, uh, I think I still have some questions about this because at first you mentioned a lot of different thoughts you could be having. [Kerry: Mm-hmm.] Then we got more specific. It could just be dehydration, but maybe we're not totally sure. Maybe it's really quick thoughts in a row. Um, but it's, it's impossible to figure out everything on the first beep. So that's why we do this over many days. Uh, Russ or Mel, do you guys, do you guys have questions or comments?
- RTH: 14:47 So I think I would prefer to go on to beep number 2, rather than to try to figure this beep out.
- 14:47 Russ comments: I thought (as I said in my previous comments) that the interview has been on the wrong track for 15 minutes, and at this time I thought it would be better to start fresh than to go back and try to get the 1.1 sample back on track. Whether that was the best decision is hard to say.
- JBK: 14:53 Okay.
- RTH: 14:54 But Mel, you got...
- Mel: 14:57 At risk of, okay. I just had two, two burning questions for me, and I hope that I don't fuck this up. Um, but the two burning questions I wrote down, Kerry, were, I'd be interested in asking, is there a percentage split that you could give between, um, the voice in your own head being like, so your awareness at that time in the moment before the beep, what's the percentage split between the voice in your own head and the, um, physical sensations in terms of hearing your housemate and also feeling the bloody nose?
- Kerry: 15:38 I think it'd be hard to give a percentage split. Um, but for this particular moment, I would say the voice was quite loud in my head because I, I di-, I really don't wanna get a bloody nose in public. And so I think immediately this became kind of a worry; going through that list became a worry. So that I would say the voice, I was paying more attention to the voice than I was the blood going down my face, for example. Like, I was leaned over at the sink, but I was looking at myself in the mirror going through these questions, not as concerned about wiping my face, if that makes sense. So the primary dominant thing in that moment was my list of questions that I was going through.

15:38 Russ comments: This was a pretty clear statement about what was (questions) and what was not (face wiping) experienced at the moment of the beep.

Mel: 16:22 Mm-hmm. Interesting. Yeah. And then the other thing on very similar, but, um, you mentioned your, that voice in your head going through those things. And as you are listening to your housemate, my question there is just, is that a concurrent experience? Do both those voices happen at once in your awareness?

Kerry: 16:46 Yes. Um, I never really noticed about this, about myself until thinking about it more deeply, but I do sort of have, yeah, a double... conversation going. Even as I'm speaking, I have thoughts in my head about, am I saying like too much? Or I could be going through a sentence, but I'm still having other sentences said in my mind at, at the same time. [laughs]

Mel: 17:17 No more questions for me

RTH: 17:22 Then. Julian, are we ready to go on to number 2?

JBK: 17:25 We could go on. I, I'll say one thing is I, I don't want to pin down that there was a voice, well, a voice could be different things for different people. It could be more just the thoughts or it could be something specifically auditory. And that's still something I'm not sure about. So I, I wanna keep that open for myself. Um, but I guess, yeah, I still think it's early, early to say on that one. Um, but should we, should we go on for now?

SAMPLE 1.2 DISCUSSION STARTS HERE

RTH: 18:02 So what's in your experience at the moment of the second beep?

Kerry: 18:07 Um, I was, um, okay, so it was 9:14. I was doing some work, but in the exact moment that the beep went off, I was actually sort of daydreaming about a, an upcoming, um, rafting and kayaking trip that I'm going on. And, um, at the moment of the beep [laughs], I had a visual of my sister and I, in like dry suits and holding kayaks basically. And in my head I was saying "all the gear and absolutely no idea," [laughs] which is kind of weird, but it was almost as though I was like, daydreaming of an Instagram post. Like, it was like visual. And I was like also coming up with a caption of what I, of what I would, what I might post in the future of this trip that's coming up. So i, it was both visual and I was like hearing just that sentence, "all the gear and absolutely no idea." But I was supposed to be working and I was looking at my laptop in that moment.

RTH: 19:15 So do I understand that at the, at the moment that's interrupted by the beep, there's sort of two thing, two major things going on, related, two related major things? One is I'm seeing myself and my sister and the kayak, [coughs] excuse me. And the other is, there are these words, "all the gear and absolutely no idea."

Kerry: 19:33 Yes.

RTH: 19:35 And those are simultaneous? Simultaneous?

Kerry: 19:36 Those are simultaneous, yeah.

RTH: 19:37 And is one of those more prominent than the other?

Kerry: 19:41 I would say the, in this instance the visuals were a lot stronger. I was, I knew exactly what section of the Snake River I was on outside of Grand Teton National Park. I could see the bridge that we were about to theoretically cross under. It was the, this, this scene that I was imagining is a scene that I've been to on a raft trip before.

RTH: 20:07 And so at the moment of the beep, and by at the moment of the beep, I mean, what is [snaps fingers] interrupted, pierced by the beep, so to speak? Do you see the bridge? Or do you see your sister and you and the kayak? Or, or both? Or...

20:07 Julian Comments: This is a good way to clarify the moment of the beep. I think my beep 1 questioning failed because I never did this. As you mentioned, none of my subsequent clarification questions landed anywhere because we weren't on firm enough premises to begin with.

Kerry: 20:20 It's kind of both.

RTH: 20:20 Tell me, tell me exactly what you see [Kerry: Yeah.] right, right, right then. Not before then, or not after then or whatever, but, but what do you, what do you see?

Kerry: 20:30 I see, um, a bridge crossing the Snake River on the left side. Um, a curved bank with rocks, the river's flowing. My sister and I are in dry suits and helmets holding, um, like kayaks, like propped up kind of. And then, um,

RTH: 20:46 Two kayaks.

Kerry: 20:47 Two kayaks. We each have our own kayak and we each have our own oar. Um, I can't tell in the vision if we've already been kayaking or if we're about to go, cuz we're kind of just off to the side. Um, but I can see like the rocks, the trees around us, the river bending and the, the bridge on the left side.

RTH: 21:07 So the bridge is on the, the bridge is on the left side and you and your sister are on the right side?

Kerry: 21:11 Yes. It's as if someone's taking a photo from the water, um, which is, would be difficult to do, but... [laughs]

RTH: 21:20 Okay. Imagination's a wonderful thing. [Kerry: Yeah. (laughs)] It can do plenty of things that are not possible to do. So, so does that mean that that occupying most of what you see at this particular moment is the bridge and you're the sort of, you and your sister are a smaller portion off to the right?

Kerry: 21:35 I would say [RTH: Or...] the bridge is more, it's like, I'm looking, my sister and I are standing in a landscape photo, so the bridge is probably not primary. My sister, it's almost like a, yeah, I would say medium portrait. Like you can see our full body, you can see the expressions on our face and the bridge is kind of there, but it's not super.... It's detailed in that it looks realistic, but it's probably not accurate.

RTH: 22:04 Okay. And as, as you look at it, is the, are, is your sister to the left or...?

22:04 Russ comments: I ask for these details as a way of ascertaining what we mean by "see." Kerry provides visual details with confidence, which I understand to suggest that the phenomenon is visual.

Kerry: 22:09 I'm on the, the left. My sister's on the right.

RTH: 22:12 You're on the left. And are you looking at the camera or looking at each other or

Kerry: 22:16 At the camera.

RTH: 22:17 Okay. And is this picture in color?

Kerry: 22:21 Yes.

RTH: 22:23 Okay. So I'm, I'm gathering that, that this aspect is a quite clear detailed snapshot-y deal. Is that right? [Kerry: Yes.] And is there any, is, I wanna, I said snapshot, that was my word. A snapshot has a border around it. Does this have a border around it or does it seem like you're just looking out into this scene?

Julian comments: "just looking out into this scene" is a simple way to ask about it. I've probably asked similar things (with Kerry and others) but with more confusion. Like:
a) Asking about her visual space - An unnecessary abstraction.
b) If it feels like it's surrounding her - Involves speculation. She sees what she sees but it's speculative to talk about what's around her and to the sides.
c) If she's in the scene - Focuses too much on her positioning. Where the focus should be on her seeing. Which is why I like your phrasing of "just looking out into this scene."

Kerry: 22:46 It looks, yeah, there's no border and there's also, even though we're describing it as a snapshot, there is movement. So, and I can also hear my sister's laugh, like, almost like you're looking at a... Someone, a video of someone taking a picture. The photographer's not in there, but it's like a moving photo and I can hear my sister's laugh and I can hear the water and the tree's moving. So it's auditory as well. So

22:46 Russ comments: Russ has suggested *snapshot*; Kerry says it's *more* than a snapshot. I take that as an indication that Kerry is not merely acquiescing to my suggestions but is (probably) trying to describe her experience. Good!

RTH: 23:15 It's like you, it is like you're there, somebody, you're seeing this scene [Kerry: Yes.] that includes visual and auditory [Kerry: Yes.] and stuff. And do you see, do you see your sister move as she's laughing? Or is...

Kerry: 23:29 Yeah. She kind of always does this thing where she like, looks at me like laughs and then looks at the camera when we're taking a photo together. So she's kind of doing that. [Russ: Okay]. *I'm* looking straight at the camera.

RTH: 23:40 Alright. So I'm happy with that portion of this experience. Anybody else wanna ask anything about that? [pause] And then there are the words, "all the gear and absolutely no idea." [Kerry: Yeah.] Are those present to you at exactly the same time as the picture?

Kerry: 23:57 Yeah. It's almost like I was looking at this scene and like brainstorming, uh, ([laughs] this is really embarrassing) but brainstorming a future Instagram caption [laughs] about what, about a photo that we might take on this trip, if that makes sense.

23:57 Russ comments: That Kerry would be embarrassed but continue is a sign that she takes this task seriously and is trying to describe her experience without cleaning it up. Good!

RTH: 24:15 And is it, is it these exact words, [Kerry: Yes.] "all the gear and absolutely no idea"? [Kerry: Yeah.] And how are those words present to you?

Kerry: 24:24 How are they presented to me?

RTH: 24:27 Yeah.

Kerry: 24:28 Um, in my mind, I'm just hearing my voice. I mean, I'm not *seeing* any words on like, I'm, I'm not visualizing it as like an Instagram post. I'm seeing the scene and I'm hearing my voice say "all the gear and absolutely no idea." I had finished that sentence in my mind and then the beep went off.

RTH: 24:47 Okay. And so this is clearly your voice?

Kerry: 24:50 Yes.

RTH: 24:51 And in, as, as your voice generally sounds? Or as

Kerry: 24:55 Yes. Yeah.

RTH: 24:56 As if, as you're talking now, that that's the voice that we're talking about.

Kerry: 25:01 Yeah. Conversational pace in my, in my voice.

RTH: 25:04 And words unfolding when one after another, [Kerry: Yes.] all... Okay. And, and the is the phenomenon of *hearing* your voice or *speaking* your voice. And I would like to make a distinction there of the, sort of the difference between speaking into a tape

recorder and hearing your voice come back out of a tape recorder. Same words, same voice, same inflection, same everything, except that in one case, I'm, I'm more speaking it in the other case, I'm more hearing it.

Kerry: 25:31 Hmm. I think how I hear myself speaking now is how I hear my voice in my mind. So,

RTH: 25:39 And so do you experience yourself now as hearing your voice speaking, or do you experience your voice right now as speaking?

25:39 Julian comments: I think this is risky in that it assumes her experience at the time of the beep really is exactly the same. It could be useful for iterative training—for her to be able to make the distinction on other days. And to that end, RTH does say let's not try to nail it down.

Still I think even this could cement habits of assuming general properties of experience. That she can use her experience during the interview to answer questions about experience during the beep.

Russ comments: I think it does not at all assume that, and this question is not risky. The object of RTH's 25:39 question is to help Kerry aim at distinguishing between hearing and speaking. Here it is aimed at an external event, but there is no assumption that external events and inner events are the same.

RE: "That she can use her experience during the interview to answer questions about experience during the beep."

RTH did not suggest, nor was it his intention to suggest, that Kerry should presume that her experience during the interview was the same as her experience at a beep. It could very well be that sometimes speaking is experienced as produced and sometimes as heard, and sometimes *inner* speaking is experienced as produced and sometimes as heard. That distinction *might* apply on some occasions but not others, or on no occasions. We are sorting through the distinction, not applying one experience to another.

Kerry: 25:47 I experience myself as hearing my voice, speaking.

RTH: 25:50 Even now when we're talking?

Kerry: 25:51 Yes. I think. [looks quizzical] [inaudible, (laughs conspiratorially?)]

RTH: 25:54 Okay. So when, when I, I would like us to leave that distinction as, as being, well, *that's sort of weird or interesting or whatever*, but let's not try to nail that down. Let's, let's leave that as sort of an open question, that, well, was this speaking or hearing when I'm talkin'? [Kerry: Yeah.] It could be either way. And, uh, and I, I don't have a favorite about that. I jus...

Kerry: 26:17 I also think I'm unsure about my answer. I would wanna like, unpack that a little bit more before.

- RTH: 26:22 Absolutely. And, and, and the, the advantage, or *an* advantage, built into the procedure that we're undertaking here *is* that we're not particularly interested, we don't particularly value this particular beep. We're interested in this particular beep, but, but maybe even more important than this particular beep is *next* week or whenever we do this kind of a thing again, that we, we can profit from the experience that we're having today. And next time, we'll, we'll have some practice of talking about it and practice in hearing what kind of questions people ask and whatever. And that'll shape how we, how we respond next, next go 'round.
- 27:03 So, so far what I've got is I'm seeing a picture [coughs]—I shouldn't say a *picture*, I shouldn't say a *scene*. I am seeing, I'm experiencing a scene that's visual and uh, and auditory. *And* I am hearing / speaking / whatever the words, sp, the specific words that are sort of like a caption of an Instagram.
- Kerry: 27:28 Yes.
- RTH: 27:29 And is the Instagram por, portion part of this experience? Like, I'm planning an Instagram. Is, is that really true? I'm planning an Instagram?
- Kerry: 27:42 Uh, I think, I think it's more, I would describe this experience, this moment, more as a daydream. And then that caption, I was like, oh, *that'd be kind of funny* because my sister's a really good kayaker and I'm really bad. So it was more, it's more, I'm s–, I'm daydreaming about the scene, not necessarily like planning content moreso, oh, that would be a funny thing to write about this experience in the future. Does that make sense?
- RTH: 28:14 So I, I'm not sure that I understood that. So the, the, is the funny thing about the future present to you at the moment of the beep? Or is that sort of like, sort of the broad context of this daydream?
- Kerry: 28:26 I would say it's, wait, can you say that again? Sorry.
- RTH: 28:34 Well, maybe it's, maybe that question is not the best question to answer, to ask. And so maybe we should just leave that, leave that question. So let, let me ask you, let me ask sort of a similar question, but in a different way. [Kerry: Okay.] Is there anything else in your direct experience at the moment of *this* beep? Other than I'm seeing the scene, experiencing the scene, and these words?
- Kerry: 29:00 I am physically sitting down looking at my laptop. But I, I would say anything that I'm looking at, I'm not really taking in the information because this scene is very clear in front of me, if that makes sense. So I'm aware that I'm sitting down looking at my laptop. I'm aware of my surroundings. But I would say it's just an awareness. It's not, I'm not reading anything on my laptop screen, even though I'm looking directly at it because this scene is very clearly in front of me.
- 29:00 Russ comments: Kerry is making a pretty clear distinction between what is directly apprehended and what is processed without direct apprehension. We will want to refine that, but that is a good sign for the first sampling day.

RTH: 29:37 And by, so the word *awareness* is sort of an ambiguous term for me. So does that mean before the footlights of my consciousness I'm aware of this? Or does that mean that I'm processing all this stuff?

Kerry: 29:49 I think like

RTH: 29:50 For, for example, I could, I could say right now I am aware of the screen that I'm looking at and it's got black, it is black and it's got four windows in it and it's got an, y'know, but for the most part I haven't been attending to that. I've been paying attention to Kerry sort of zoomed in on, on Kerry and the rest of that stuff. I'm aware that it's there, but I'm not, I'm, I'm not really, y'know, I, I might as well have annihilated Mel and annihilated Julian at this particular moment. I, my, as far as my experience is concerned, they don't have anything to do with it. I'm, I'm into Kerry and trying to figure out what Kerry's saying.

Kerry: 30:27 Yeah, that's kind of how I would describe it. I, for example, I am aware that there's a bunch of folders on my desktop, but I'm not reading any of them, even though I'm looking at it kind of broadly because this scene is in front of me. So I can vaguely see things, but I'm not processing it in the sense that I'm not fully, I can't tell you what's in those folders because I'm not really paying attention to it.

RTH: 30:54 So as, as we go forwards, I think it'll be of, of interest, probably, to determine how much of that awareness is actually directly present and how much of it is being processed. So I, I think it's quite possible that your, your bag of bones, your brain and neurons and whatever is processing a whole lot of stuff all, all at the same time. Mostly your, mostly you're skillfully processing it. You're, you're sitting on the chair, your backside is processing what's on the chair cuz you haven't fallen off the chair or whatever, but, but you're not saying, oh, this is the way the chair feels, or, and, and you're not really making that specific. And so I would say, well, that's probably *not* before the footlights of your consciousness. It's there, you're processing it skillfully, um, quite obviously, but that's, that's a distinction that we'll want to keep in mind.

JBK: 31:42 Hmm.

RTH: 31:45 So I'm happy with that. Anybody else wanna ask anything?

JBK: 31:52 I, I think I have a less clear picture of the image than, than Russ, or you, Kerry, for that matter. So you're, you're to the left, your sister's on the right. [Kerry: Mm-hmm.] you point as if from the river.

Kerry: 32:08 Yes. So,

JBK: 32:11 Mm-hmm, Go ahead.

Kerry: 32:11 My, my sight is almost as though I... So I see myself, but I, I, it's as if someone asked me, Hey, can you take a photo of these two girls on the riverbank? And the, this bridge is on the left side. So, but I don't know who, I don't like really know who that perspective is. It's not identified as not a clear person. So I'm, but I'm seeing from

their point of view. So I see they're on a raft, um, theoretically, or some sort of mechanism that's holding them up in the water because the water is in front. Then there's a rocky beach. My sister and I are standing, I'm on the left, she's on the right. And then the bridge is to, further to my left, slightly in the distance, but not too far.

JBK: 32:59 Okay. I, I see it! [laughs] That makes sense.

Kerry: 33:04 Yeah. [laughs]

Mel: 33:07 Can I ask a question and I might get yelled at. Have you, have you been to this place before?

Kerry: 33:12 Yes. Yeah. [Mel: Okay.] My sister had, for her wedding, had like a rafting trip that we did. And the place that I'm visualizing is the place where the raft trip ended.

Mel: 33:24 Mm-hmm.

RTH: 33:29 Okay. Number 3.

SAMPLE 1.3 DISCUSSION STARTS HERE

Kerry: 33:32 Number 3. Um, so, oh, I was reading an email, um, and basically a, a, so I'm a graphic designer and a client was giving me feedback on a logo design. Um, so I was reading her feedback line-by-line and the beep went off when I was like mid-sentence. But, uh, as I'm reading the email, there's no, no visuals, but I, I'm reading it out loud in my mind. So her email said, "looks great. I think we can remove the two dots on either side so there's only one, or maybe a diamond in black instead." And the beep went off when I was reading "maybe a diamond in black," cuz she did an emoji. And so I like was paused there.

JBK: 34:20 Okay. So you're reading "maybe a diamond [Kerry: Mm-hmm.] in black," "maybe a diamond in black"? Yeah. And that's in texts in like in written letters or with an emoji or...?

Kerry: 34:36 So her, yeah, all her entire email was text-based, but instead of writing out the word *diamond*, she used a diamond emoji. So I kind of like paused there for a second, um, because the diamond was red, but she was saying "in black."

JBK: 34:52 [laughs], [Kerry laughs],

Kerry: 34:54 And so I paused cuz I wanted to make sure I was getting the, um, feedback correct. But it was all, like I wasn't visualizing anything. It was all, it was just my, my voice looking at the screen. And I was, I would say I was more aware of what was on my screen in this moment. Um, yeah.

JBK: 35:15 So you're, you're reading this email, "the diamond in black," and is it more about this, the, the voice? Or more about looking at the screen? Or more about thinking about what it means? Anything else?

Kerry: 35:33 I would say I wasn't putting any sort of thought into this. I was trying to, my aim was to absorb the information. So, [JBK: Mm-hmm] um, yeah, I, I, in this exact moment, it wasn't necessarily, I wasn't like placing an opinion on whether this feedback was good or bad, or anything like that. I was just strictly reading her text, absorbing the information, [JBK: Mm-hmm] but sort of in an auditory way.

JBK: 36:04 Okay. And when you say your, your voice reading it, that's, that's literal auditory, like something you can hear in some way? Or is it voice more metaphorically, like, like the, the content coming to you somehow?

36:04 Russ comments: Or your voice speaking?

Kerry: 36:21 Yeah, I would say in this specific, I think I, yeah, in this specific moment, this was my, my voice as I hear it reading word for word as though I'm like reading a book to myself, if that makes sense. So,

JBK: 36:35 Okay. We could, we could ask the same kind of tape recorder question that Russ asked before. Is it more about the voice as in as if you're speaking it into a tape recorder or as if you're hearing it played back? Or does that not make sense? [Kerry: Yeah...] the difference....

Kerry: 36:54 Okay. I think I answered incorrectly before. I think it's, it's speaking, not hearing it played back, not like, it's not, I don't have any distance between the voice, if that makes sense. So exactly what I'm hearing right now, as, as I'm speaking, that tone, that style of speaking, which feels, I guess, quite close to me, is in my mind as well.

JBK: 37:19 Okay. So, so maybe more in the speaking. [Kerry: Yeah.] And again, it could be something that we might find more about later, but we don't have to pin it down too close on the first day. That, that's a tricky question. [Kerry: Hmm.] Um, is it as clear and auditory as when you're physically s, speaking it out loud or, or not?

37:19 Russ comments: For most people, physically speaking is not experienced primarily as auditory. So *clear* and *auditory* are, or at least can be, two very different phenomenal aspects.

Kerry: 37:45 In this instance, when I was reading this email, it was very clear. Um, I think in other instances, like for example when I was going through the questions about the bloody nose, those are harder to distinguish. I think some of them I could hear in my voice, some of them I was, it was like going rea-, cuz the thoughts were going really fast. So it wasn't, like my voice wasn't fast enough to go, to keep up with the auditory thoughts. Whereas this, I was, I think because I was reading and I was trying to digest the information, I was really focused, I was hearing just my voice.

JBK: 38:28 Okay, it's your voice. Is it normal pitch and tone or high pitch, low pitch, something, something else?

- 38:28 Russ comments: *Pitch* and *tone* are primarily auditory phenomena, so here and in 37:19 and 36:04, JBK has pushed in the direction of hearing, rather than speaking. That is problematic, from my point of view, because (a) Kerry has been working at trying to be careful about this distinction (e.g., 36:54 “I think I answered incorrectly before”); and (b) Kerry apparently naturally refers to the speaking as *hearing*, so JBK’s pushing may align with Kerry’s presupposition.
- Kerry: 38:38 Um, I would say normal. Um, I’m trying to think. Yeah, I would say just normal with how I normally hear my voice.
- JBK: 38:49 Okay. And for, for speed, is it like, does it come with a, a sequence, a, a speed as if you’re reading sequentially, “maybe a diamond in black,” or is it all at once? Or how would you describe that?
- Kerry: 39:06 I, I’m a pretty slow reader. So a as I was reading this, it was like I wasn’t speeding up anything. Like the, the pace would be like, [speaks deliberately] “looks great. I think we removed two dots on either side. So there is only room, there’s, so there’s only one or maybe a diamond in black instead.” That’s the exact pace.
- JBK: 39:23 Mm-hmm. Okay. Would you say this experience, so “maybe a diamond in black”: is it the very last thing before the beep? [Kerry: Yeah.] Would you say that’s, that’s in some way a, a, a, a chunk that makes sense? Or, or was it really about the whole sentence, but that just happens to be the last part of it before the beep? [inaudible]
- Kerry: 39:59 I think, I mean, everything was making sense to me. I did, I, I think I, I just tripped up because she used an emoji in the middle of the sentence. So I was looking at, I was kind of like, *wait, what?* I was hoping she didn’t want a, um, red diamond in the logo design [laughs] [JBK laughs]. And so I, I kind of paused there and had to reread it. Um, but that, that sort of hope of not wanting it to be red, that was not auditory. I don’t really know how to explain that. So I can hear, like, I’m reading this email; that’s all auditory. But where I stumbled... that desire to not wanna put a red diamond in the logo was not something I was verbalizing. So it was kind of like two things happening at once. Like, I’m reading this email, but I, I paused on that red diamond cuz I was like, *please, no, don’t tell me to do that*. [JBK: Okay.] But I wasn’t auditorily saying that.
- JBK: 41:00 So, so the part that we’ve been talking about with the voice, this, this is a rereading of this part that you read before?
- Kerry: 41:07 Yes. The, the, that exact sentence.
- JBK: 41:10 Okay. So there’s this auditory kind of like reading / speaking / hearing it, and then there’s this, this hoping it’s, it’s not red. Can we,
- 41:10 Julian comments: “there’s this this hoping” is much too directive. It’s possible that hoping experientially came much later. Or that it didn’t figure in experience but as a retrospective explanation. I return to this line of questioning later, with more caution but still not enough.

- RTH: 41:23 Before we, can we nail down a couple more details about the auditory before we leave then?
- JBK: 41:29 Yeah, yeah. Go ahead.
- RTH: 41:31 So I, I understand that the words, words are maybe a diamond in black and, but there's something about the, but, but what you see is not the word diamond. What you see is a red diamond. And now sort of late in this conversation there, there's some kind of a pause or something. So could you tell me more about what actually the speaking experience is, hearing experience, whatever it is?
- Kerry: 41:57 Mm-hmm, um, I didn't say in my mind "red diamond." I didn't say the words "red diamond." I read it as, "or maybe a diamond in black instead." I still read it as "diamond," but because the emoji diamond was red, that's where the pause kind of I guess like, yeah...
- RTH: 42:21 So what I would, yeah, what I would like to know is, is the pause in the speaking / hearing / reading, whatever, whatever that is? So is it, "or maybe a [pause] diamond in red"? Or is it, or "maybe a diamond in red" [with no pause]. I would like to know in the speaking portion, whether it included a pause or a something at, at the word diamond.
- 42:21 Russ comments: I don't expect Kerry to be able to answer these questions compellingly, because this is a greater level of detail than she was prepared for at the moment of the beep. This is iterative training: Kerry is discovering, for herself on her own turf, that Russ is interested in the details of her experience and its timing. (See the comment at 3:55.)
- Kerry: 42:47 I don't think when I was, cuz I was trying to sort of do this quickly, so I was, it was auditory and I'm a slow reader, so it's not that fast. But I think I was, I read it quickly as "maybe a diamond in black instead" [quickly with no pause], but then because I saw the red color in the email line, that's where I paused. So I still read it, um, kind of quickly. But because there's color in that email line, which I'm not used to, that's where I was like, wait, and I had to re, to read it again to see what she meant.
- RTH: 43:23 Okay.
- JBK: 43:25 Um, and so there's a pause and hoping it's not red. Is it more about a, a pause? Is there confusion or hoping it's not red? Or you are not, you are not sure about that part?
- Kerry: 43:44 Um, I think it was more of a, it was probably a little bit of confusion and a little bit of hope. Um, both, both coming from the root of: this is gonna look really bad. So (a) why does she want to do that? And (b) um, I really hope she doesn't wanna do that because I, I don't wanna do that. Um, so, but tho— those aren't, those aren't auditory thoughts that I'm having. It was more of just, I don't really know how to describe it. Like I'm reading the email, but I'm having almost like a subset of like, emotions around what I'm reading or secondary.

JBK: 44:24 Ok. So some confusion, some, some hope. Um, I will, I guess I don't wanna, it's hard to pin down— emotions can be very hard. So let me think if, if I can ask some more, some more good questions about this. Would you, would you say it's between, let see, is it more in confusion, more in hope, both simultaneously? Are they separate things? Are they part of the same thing or are you really not, like, is it really hard to say about this?

44:24 Russ comments: This line of questioning (beginning at 43:25) does not adequately separate the directly apprehended experience of confusion / hope from some inferred state of confusion / hope. I think you have to be clear about that distinction before you can become clear in distinguishing between confusion and hope.

Kerry: 45:03 Um, I would say it feels like it's coming from the same place. Like it feels like the same thing. Um, both becau— both, it's both of those two things—the hope and the confusion kind of sit under just a desire of not wanting to do that. Um, which feels like one thing in my mind.

JBK: 45:30 So it's kind of not wanting to do that. It's, so, I'm not, I'm not thinking in words, "I don't want to do that," but there's part of this. Is it like, um, would you say it's a clear thing, like clearly articulable, *I don't wanna do that*? Or is it kinda just like a *uunhh*,

Kerry: 45:53 I have no idea how to articulate where that thought slash feeling was coming from or, or how it was coming about in my mind. It was more of a, almost like a guttural response. [laughs]. Like, I was like, aargh, I, I, I think I made a noise. Like I was like, aargh, as I was reading it, so I was hearing the sentence of the email, but as I was hearing that sentence, I, I [snaps] very quickly was just like, mghm, because I didn't want this to happen. But I, it's not that I was thinking, y'know, a direct quote, oh, I don't wanna do that. That's not how, that was, that thought was coming about. It was more of almost like a feeling.

JBK: 46:41 Okay. Did it have a bodily location, this feeling?

46:41 Russ comments: She said it was "almost like a feeling," which JBK reified to "feeling."

Kerry: 46:47 Um, probably my gut. Like just, yeah, I think when, as I'm kind of redoing it, like my th— [gestures to throat], I stop breathing sort of like [enacts a slight spasm] I just, like, I do that, like I hold my breath and like flex my gut when I'm having something that's like having a feeling that's something I don't wanna do, I guess.

JBK: 47:14 Okay. But sometimes if you're, if you're thinking it can be kind of tricky because if you feel something again now, like it could be close to the feeling you had then, or it might be [Kerry: Mm-hmm.] a little bit different. Um, [Kerry: Mm-hmm.] But yeah, it could be like gut as in like a literal physical thing. It could be gut more metaphorically, but, but yeah. Maybe let's not pin this one down too much, but let me see if there's anything else I wanna ask about this. Are, so you, you might be making a noise, too. Are you, are you experiencing making this noise or is it just kind of like an automatic thing that happens but you're really mostly experiencing, y'know, reading it or?

47:14 Julian comments: It's true that reenacted memories may be very different from the original experience. But it's also true that I pushed Kerry in this direction by not being careful enough with my questioning. Even if she *did* have a feeling at this moment, this beep would serve best for iterative training. I give two options for gut being literal or metaphorical. But I didn't give enough space to feeling being more causal explanation than directly experienced.

I have a bad habit in my DES interviewing of snowballing what I ask about. If I'm interviewing about inner speaking and Kerry mentions something that could be construed as a feeling, then I'll ask about that. If in the process of discussing a feeling she brings up making a noise, I'll ask about that. One intent is to make sure nothing is missed. If something is brought up, it should be explored. But at it's worst it snowballs to tack on a bunch of things that weren't actually in experience. Rule: the later into an interview something is brought up, the more care must be taken.

47:14 Russ comments: RE "Rule: the later into an interview something is brought up, the more care must be taken"

In the *it's not about the words* vein, I think the rule is more general than "the later...." I think words are best thought of as gestures, rather like lookee-over-there pointings, where the *there* is ambiguous. It could be that Kerry makes the gesture because she is trying to steer the conversation into something that is important but not yet described (and perhaps hard to describe); or it could be that she gestures because she takes Julian to have indicated that *we need more detail! C'mon!* The aim, as I would see it, is to try to ride along with Kerry's gesture and discern whether she is trying to point at something new about her experience or whether she is trying to satisfy Julian's implied need for details.

The rule is to work at abrading away Julian's needs (e.g., for details, completeness) in favor of genuine interest in Kerry's experience. Every interview with every participant about every sample provides the opportunity to inject a grain of sand into the abrading process—how much of that was about *me* and how much of that was about *Kerry*? No individual answer to those questions needs to be perfect, but to the extent that Julian genuinely pursues them, over the years, Julian's needs will disappear, and Kerry's experience will be all that's left.

Kerry: 48:09 Yeah, I, um, that I definitely am most often not aware of, like auditory, like laughs or groans or anything when I'm processing things. Um, I, like if I'm looking at an Instagram post and I find it funny, I'll laugh without realizing I'm like laughing really loudly and it's annoying to people. So for this example, me making sort of a groan, I'm not fully aware of it, but I, yeah, I know I'm, [sighs] I guess I, I'm baseline aware that I'm doing that, but I'm more focused on what I'm hearing, which is the email and, and the feeling than the physical [JBK: Yeah.] is probably like a third of that. So it's like I hear my voice, I feel this emotion that I don't wanna do the red diamond, and then I physically react. Those are kind of like the order, uh, in this moment.

JBK: 49:12 Okay. So the physical groaning is, is like the, the least of it. Um, yeah, maybe background may—, could even be totally background. Um, so for this one, I, what I've got is: I'm, I'm reading an email, I'm reading out loud, "maybe a diamond in black

instead.” Um, my voice. Diamond is the emoji, but I’m, I’m reading it like I’m as a word and reading is, is more about speaking than hearing at this moment, but that, that could be a tricky distinction too. So I don’t want to be like overconfident on that. Um, and I also feel, uh, ki– kind of confused hope-y feeling like don’t, don’t want it to be that. Like, hmm. And this one, it’s an unsure how, like, lemme say what is it is kind of just one thing. It’s not like two separate feelings of I feel confused and I feel hopeful. It’s kind of just one thing. Yeah. Um,

Kerry: 50:29 Just a general desire of not wanting to do that.

JBK: 50:32 But I guess what’s unsure for me is if it’s like, if it’s super clear as in like, I hope it’s not that like even if there’s no words to it, if it’s clearly that or it was just kind of like, uunh, like, um, like, uh, I don’t know what I’m saying. But [laughs] but also you’re, you’re physically making a noise, but that, that may be more background. So that’s, that’s what I have on this. Russ or Mel, do you guys have questions?

RTH: 51:11 Well, I, I, I am concerned, I guess so not, lemme ask some questions. I’m, I’m not sure that at this point that I can extricate the, the questions, but I would like to go back to the what we’ve been calling *feeling*. But I’m, I’m not, uh, I’m, I, and by the conversation I haven’t become convinced that there actually was a feeling involved. [Kerry: Mm.] I’m gathering that there was some kind of a negative hope kind of a deal that was part of the, part of this moment. But how, or whether that was directly experienced, I think we have sort of reified that. And so I would like to un-reify it. Not, not that I know what’s going on here, but I think it’s possible to be saying “maybe a diamond in black” and, and have that saying somehow reflect the fact that I am, my state is, my body is, my neurons are, whatever, hopeful that that isn’t the right thing, but that doesn’t mean that I have a *feeling* [Kerry: Mmm.] that I hope that’s the right thing. And we’ve sort of talked about it as if there was a feeling about that, which I’m not sure that that.... I, I wanna, I, I, I think maybe we have reified that or made it more, more a something than it is.

Kerry: 52:33 I don’t fully know how to describe that element. Um, so *feeling* might be the wrong word. Um, maybe *reaction* or, um, yeah, maybe reaction is better than feeling. I’m not sure.

RTH: 52:54 Yeah, I’m not either. And I don’t, I think at this point it’s probably the, there’s too much water over the dam to figure it out. So I’m, I’m what I want, what I really am doing in this conversation is thinking about next week or whatever that, that I don’t want us to say, well, just because there’s some kind of a reaction or feeling or whatever we wanna call it that we’re gonna, that we call it a feeling and treat it like it was a standalone deal or separate thing from the words or something. Maybe it was or maybe it wasn’t.

53:24 So it’s 10 o’clock, which is to say, we’ve been at this for an hour. Uh, should we say this is good? Or should we do another one? Or,

Kerry: 53:34 I’ve got three more beeps. I don’t know. Um, [laughs] one’s kind of funny. [laughs]

Mel: 53:42 I have time. I'm, I'm conscious of anyone else that has a tight work schedule, but I'm fine to hear more, but if someone has commitments, happy to call it. So speak now.

JBK: 53:54 I'm, I'm fine to do I, I think one more. Um,

RTH: 53:59 All right, let's do one more,

Mel: 54:00 One more.

RTH: 54:02 And you get, you get to pick, you get to pick this one.

SAMPLE 1.4 DISCUSSION STARTS HERE

Kerry: 54:04 I'm gonna pick this one because it's funny. [Mel: Yay!] [Kerry laughs]. At 10:34 AM I was standing in my kitchen facing my sink, eating a banana and thinking about my finances. So the moment that the beep went off, I was doing math in my head, but I was saying the numbers out, out loud. So I was saying "900 plus 967 is roughly 1800 [pronounced as eighteen-hundred throughout]. So by the time I move here in August, I'll actually be saving \$300 a month." So the beep went off right as I was saying "by the time I move here in August." So I was, yeah, there's no, no visuals. Like I, I was facing my sink, but I, I was, it's almost as though there's like a daze and I'm just, I'm really focused on the voice in my head, which is saying, which is doing the math, but it's saying the math out loud.

RTH: 54:57 So the, the words are "900 plus 987," I, I couldn't keep track. [Kerry: 967.] 967. "900 plus 967 [Kerry: is roughly 1800] is roughly 1800. [Kerry: Yep.] And so by the time I get here in August..."

Kerry: 55:15 And then the beep goes.

RTH: 55:16 Then the beep goes off. And, and, and so the beep happens somewhere in "by the time I get here in August," "time," "by the time I move here"? [Kerry: Yeah.] What, what, what are the exact words?

Kerry: 55:26 "So by the time I move here in August." [RTH: Okay.] And then I was basically saying that I'll be saving money [laughs].

RTH: 55:32 Okay. And the beep, and the beep happens in there somewhere?

Kerry: 55:36 Yes.

RTH: 55:37 Okay. And, and can you be more precise about where, or is it somewhere in that phrase?

Kerry: 55:44 I would say probably move, uh, no, probably "August" is where it went off. cuz I, I definitely had said "August." [RTH: But it's..] And the beep goes.

- RTH: 55:54 "So by the time I moved here in August," then the beep cap— happens sort of at the end of that. [Kerry: Yeah.] And the, there was a whole sentence being before that "900 plus 967, [sneezes] excuse me, or whatever that was.
- Kerry: 56:05 Yeah.
- RTH: 56:06 Okay. And at, in one point I heard you to say that you were saying that out loud and, and another place I heard you to be saying, this is in my head.
- 56:06 Russ comments: She said "out loud" twice in her 54:04 (opening salvo) turn, and "in my head" once in the same turn. (See the comment at 58:32.)
- Kerry: 56:16 No, this was all in my head. I was eating a banana, so I was not speaking out loud.
- RTH: 56:21 Okay. Uh, and can you mimic for us how this, how this speaking went?
- Kerry: 56:35 Yep. Um, so probably a bit slower than reading the email because I'm bad at math. So I probably, [laughs] was like [speaks deliberately] "900 plus 967 is roughly 1800. So by the time I moved here in August." Probably the, the, the second bit was probably faster. [speaks rapidly] "so by the time I moved here in August." So it was, the math was probably slow. And then [speaks rapidly] "by the time I moved here in August," cuz that was a more, an easier thought for me to come to.
- 57:07 Julian comments: I'm not so confident of this faster and slower part because it's based on causal explanation—slower "because I'm bad at math"; faster "cuz that was [...] an easier thought". But after this interview Kerry is more aware of potential nuances of experiences and may better be able to apprehend.
- RTH: 57:07 Okay. "And so by the time I moved here in August," it sort of blurts out or [Kerry: Yeah.] spews, spews out or, or, [Kerry: Yeah.] Okay. And, and this, and we, we made a distinction between speaking and hearing. Is this, as I'm speaking this to myself, I'm hearing myself speak this. [pause] Or maybe that distinction doesn't make sense.
- Kerry: 57:30 I think I'm speaking this to myself. Um, yeah, I think, oh, I, the way I would describe the voice in my head, it's almost as though I'm having a conversation with myself. Like I *could* respond out loud if I wanted to, but I don't talk to myself out loud. So it, yeah, it does feel more like speaking.
- RTH: 57:50 Okay. Okay. And, and is the quality of the voice seem quality of the speaking seemed like your regular voice?
- Kerry: 58:03 Yes. Um, probably more so for the math part of this one. And then "by the time I moved here in August" was like, I don't normally talk that fast, so probably less sounds like it, it sounds less like my voice, my actual voice.
- RTH: 58:21 So the part that's actually interrupted by the beep is the part that's a little bit different from the, from your regular voice, but still spoken but just spoken fast or is it even sort of

Kerry: 58:32 It's still spoken. Um, it's just faster. Um, sorry, I have something in my eye. [laughs]. Um, it's just faster. [RTH: Okay.] But definitely still like I'm hearing it in my head.

58:32 Russ comments: It was said to be *speaking* in 57:30 but *hearing* here. Note that there are several inconsistencies here (recall out loud vs. in my head at 56:06). For whatever reason (perhaps because we are past an hour, perhaps because this is the first sampling day) RTH decides not to pursue them. But I note that this does *not* suggest to me that Kerry is unreliable. Instead, it suggests that we have not (or not yet) acquired the skills of describing experience with fidelity. The iterative procedure is designed to improve that over time.

RTH: 58:46 Okay. And, and so I'm happy with that portion. Anybody else wanna ask anything about this?

Mel: 58:56 I wanna check that Kerry's okay first [laughs].

Kerry: 58:58 I dunno what is going on with my eye. [laughs], sorry. I just like,

Mel: 59:03 Do, do you need to grab something?

Kerry: 59:06 I'm good. No, I'm okay.

Mel: 59:09 Um, I have one question just, um, I guess about like perhaps volume and clarity. Is that what you are hearing in your head experienced? And Russ, you'll probably tell me this bad question, but I'm gonna ask it anyway. Is that experienced in a way that is exactly the same as if you were to say it out loud in terms of clarity and, and volume?

Kerry: 59:37 Um, I, yeah, I think so. I, I'm not, I don't speak very loudly generally, so I think the voice in my s— head sort of mimics that. Um, and in terms of clarity, I think where I get, uh, where clarity in the voice sort of dampens a bit is when I'm having like, sort of racing thoughts, [Mel: Mm-hmm.] um, like really fast paced thoughts. So it's not, it's less in my voice. Like it might start in my voice and then it kind of blurs a little bit. Um, yeah, that's how I would, I would describe it generally.

RTH: 1:00:25 So there's the banana in your environment and the kitchen sink in your environment. Are those part of your experience? Or is that just a fact of the universe? I'm eating a banana and standing in front of the sink.

Kerry: 1:00:37 It's really not part of my experience to the point where I actually completely forgot that I had opened the banana because I was so, like, deep in my thought and I had put the banana down on the counter once the, the beep went off so I could, um, turn it off. And I like, forgot that it was in my hand because I was very much focused on my thoughts. So even though I was holding a banana and chewing, I like was not aware of that really. Like, I, I guess I was, cuz I wasn't choking, but I, my focus was the math I was doing in my head, and, and the thoughts about that.

RTH: 1:01:15 So that, that's a we that that's a good example to, to, to nail down the issue that we were talking a little bit, a little bit ago. And that is that your experience *annihilates* the world around you, or at least it *can*. Like there was a banana [laughs] in your hand that you were skillfully holding, you weren't dropping the banana [Kerry laughs] or, or, or squashing it and, y'know, making a, making banana mush out of it or whatever. You were, you were skillfully dealing with the banana, but not experientially *at all*, apparently.

Kerry: 1:01:44 Yeah.

RTH: 1:01:45 Mm-hmm. And, and, and that's the, and that is the difference that, that we're interested in. We're, we're interested in what's, in your experience, not what you're processing. You're processing a huge number of things all the time. Like bananas, and sink views, [clears throat] and, and eye itches and frogs in throats and [Kerry laughs] [coughs]. We're, we're doing all that stuff all the time. Mostly, mercifully enough, not in experience, but sometimes we, sometimes we have to deal with that. And, but the, but this study, what we're interested in, is just that portion, which for some reason, whatever, whatever reason (and we don't actually even care about the reason most of the time), but has, has, has become the, what, what I sometimes say "before the footlights of your consciousness," which at this time seems like this mental computation, [Kerry: Mm-hmm.] speaking to yourself about it. So I'm happy with that beep. Anybody else got anything to say about that?

JBK: 1:02:51 Um, [Mel: I don't think so.] I, "so by the time I move here in August," um, are you experientially, is there more to that? Like, "so by the time I move here in August, I'll have enough saved up to buy a dog." I, I don't know [laughs], but um, is, is, is that part of it, even if it's not verbalized, is, is something part of that? Or, or no?

Kerry: 1:03:23 I think the biggest thing is like contextually, um, making a move weighs on, on my mind. Um, just cuz there's a lot of logistics trying to find a house, someone to live with, et cetera, et cetera. So I think by, I think this sentence, it wasn't "so I could buy a dog," like it, I, I'm not really worried about like what I'm buying in the future. It's more like making my future, uh, just general living, not stressful. Um, and so yeah, I was trying to figure out what my, like rent range was for looking for places so that it wouldn't be a financially stressful move.

JBK: 1:04:19 And at this, so I, I understand that as a, as a context, you're thinking about finances and rent. At this very moment when you're doing this, "900 plus 967 is roughly 1,800. And so by the time I move here in August," is, is that experience more about just the words or is it these words and also some ac comforting something about, y'know, about, about the, the prices and the finances? And then if so, is that like something separate or is it just kind of like along with the words?

Kerry: 1:05:03 Um, I would say just generally, and I don't know if this is tied to anything, but I am like comforted by information. So I feel more calm when I have, when I feel like I know all angles of a, of a situation. So for trying to figure out my finances and also this move, um, this, this like action of me doing this math in my head was sort of me trying to

calm myself, calm myself down, um, about making a big move. Does that answer your question?

JBK: 1:05:41 Uh, in, in some ways, in some ways I don't think, I'm not sure quite what question to ask, um, because yeah, I, um, but just the idea that you have these words, so I guess there's, there's a range of options. Like it could be literally just saying these words, but they could have no meaning. They're just like, as if you're saying blah, blah, blar, blar, blar, blar. [Kerry laughs] It's just sounds. Or it could be, um, like I'm saying these words and also having a whole thought about my rent and, and what range I can afford and what apartments to afford. And it doesn't seem like it's, that, it doesn't seem like there's a whole thought process and it doesn't seem like the words are completely blah, blah, blah, like random, either. So it seems to me like it's, it's something in the range of, of like being about rent and finances. Um, so, so yeah, that's what I understand, but I'm, I'm still like not quite sure exactly where I'd put it. Um, does, does, does that seem like, does, does that make sense to you?

1:05:41 Russ comments: I don't see where that question came from. It seems to me that the words have been meaningfully about finances since the opening salvo.

Julian comments: I actually didn't hear/register the part of the sentence that came after the beep: "[...] I will actually be saving three-hundred dollars a month." This confused my questioning.

Kerry: 1:07:05 Yeah, I think, um, I think the only argument for, for this sentence being part of a broader thought process, I guess, is that I think a lot of times I have like these big macro worries and then I feel like I can make them go away through, like zooming in a little bit. So the macro worries, um, y'know, making a big move and all the finances that are involved with that. And then micro is like literally doing the math to make myself feel better about the bigger thing.

JBK: 1:07:44 Mm-hmm.

Kerry: 1:07:44 I don't know if that's more of a process or if that's still kind of small, but that's what I often do.

JBK: 1:07:52 Is, is, Is part of like a, a calming down part, part of this at this moment or,

Kerry: 1:07:57 Yes.

JBK: 1:07:59 Okay. And I, I guess I'm gonna take Russ's concern on board that we might be, or over articulating. So I, I think, um, I think it may very well be, do you think it's, do you think it's intrinsic to, to just the, the words or is it something different? Or are you not sure?

1:07:52 Julian comments: This is the snowballing effect I mentioned in my 47:14 comment. Very late in the interview, Kerry mentions trying to calm herself down (1:05:03). In trying not to leave anything out, I ask about it. And I almost certainly over-articulate it. It doesn't help that Kerry mentioned calming herself in a turn spurred by my unhelpful

questions, where she gave broad generalizations about experience. This in itself should make us *extremely* skeptical about anything mentioned here.

So anything mentioned late in an interview should be approached with skepticism. And anything mentioned in the scope of context, theory, or speculation should be approached with skepticism.

Here specifically, it probably isn't a good idea *at all* to bring up / reify / red herring ourselves with "calming". It's hard to say what motivated my questioning but I think I wanted to just ask to be extra sure and tie up loose ends. But there's no rule that you have to ask *every single question* to rule out *every possible thing* that could be in experience.

1:07:52 Russ comments: Julian's examination here is a good example of the grain of sand I referred to at 47:14. The "my unhelpful questions" do in fact disturb the process of the present interview, but recognizing that will contribute to the abrading across time.

Kerry: 1:08:34 Um, intrinsic to the words as in the words, [JBK: Like is it] sorry, I'm not sure what you mean.

JBK: 1:08:43 Is it like I'm calmly saying these words or is it something like I'm saying these words and separately I'm calming down or, or something else.

Kerry: 1:08:55 I still, I mean, the way the words are coming out is not calm. [laughs]. Um, but I think that by going through this thought process that then calms me down. So it's like a secondary thing. So it's not, it's not a calming thought process, um, at all. [laughs]

JBK: 1:09:13 Okay. So, so I, yeah, I think, I think there could be some emotional part here, but I'll take Russ's concern on board that like, emotions are really hard to talk about. So sometimes on other days we might see more. So again, I wouldn't try to pin down too much. Um, so yeah, those are, those are all the questions I have here.

1:09:13 Julian comments: I don't know why I keep bringing up "Russ's concern". I should talk about my concerns if I have them.

RTH: 1:09:43 So shall we do this again?

Kerry: 1:09:46 Yeah! [laughs].

Mel: 1:09:48 Yeah,

JBK: 1:09:50 Yeah.

Mel: 1:09:51 So I guess the easiest starting point and then people lob up from there, but I think it's always to go, does this time next week work since it worked this week? And then let's move from there.

JBK: 1:10:02 Could, could we do Thursday? [Mel: Oh yeah.] For, for me it's easier.

RTH: 1:10:07 Thursday the 30th, we would be talking about.

JBK: 1:10:10 Thursday the 30th.

Mel: 1:10:12 I could do the same time on the Thursday, yes.

Kerry: 1:10:16 Same.

RTH: 1:10:17 That'd be, that'd be okay with me.

JBK: 1:10:19 Okay.

Mel: 1:10:20 Great. That was quite easy. But that's too easy, really. There's four of us in different time zones that, that was quite impressive. [laughs].

JBK: 1:10:29 Yeah. So I'll send, I'll send the calendar invite. I'm gonna try to do a different platform, cuz Zencast has been weird for me lately. Like even this session was just so laggy. So much lag. Yeah. And then there's audio sync issues. Alright, let me pause the recording for now.

RTH: 1:10:50 So [inaudible], before you do that, right, Kerry, do you have any questions, comments, whatever that you would like to make before we depart here?

Kerry: 1:10:59 Um, no, I think, I mean, just overall, I still have the, I just wanna be helpful. So I hope this is helpful. Those were the thoughts that were running [laughs] through my brain while we were doing this. Um, but maybe I will be more comfortable as we go through things with, y'know, not every answer has to be the most, so,

RTH: 1:11:23 So I think you're doing a great job and I think, I think we're, we're the object is to try to get the group of us better at it, better at this as we go. And, uh, and I think we're, we're on the track.

Kerry: 1:11:40 Good.

Mel: 1:11:41 Can I ask you a question from a selfishly for sort of my project here. Um, did you find it challenging, like in the moment, to do this? Like how was your like, broad experience of trying to do it?

Kerry: 1:11:54 Hmm. I like writing that rubric down for myself was really helpful. That, cuz I think I was nervous like the first time it went off I was like, *oh my God, I need to remember what I was just thinking!* and was worried about it. So having that sort of note in my phone of just like the prompts of, and then I could answer it really quickly so it was more accurate. That was really helpful. And I weirdly was, I completely forgot that the thing was in my ear, so that was good. I thought I was gonna be more aware of that, but I wasn't. So, um, yeah, that was good.

Mel: 1:12:25 Okay.

RTH: 1:12:26 I guess I would like to say something about the rubric. So the, if, if it helps you, fine, but our object is not to get to a catalog. So for example, the, the last beep that we were talking about, which was the, the banana beep, we didn't, we didn't really care about what you were, where you were, what you were, what you were doing or whatever. What we cared about was your experience. [Kerry: Mm-hmm.] And so the things that were in your, in the rubric, it's fine with me for you to use a, use a rubric, but our exp our *interest* is in the experience. [Kerry: Mm-hmm.] , the rest of that stuff is [Kerry: secondary.] secondary [laughs]. Got it.

RTH: 1:13:07 Okay.

Mel: 1:13:10 Very fascinating. This is the first time I've been on this side of things and like, wow, that's, it's *wild*. [laughs].

Kerry: 1:13:19 I really wanna, once this is all over, I really wanna get a drink, Mel, and be like, what was your side? So different.

Mel: 1:13:26 I tell you, we're different people. I'm glad we're friends, though. [laughs], [laughs]. We're living life differently. That's all I'll say. [laughs].

RTH: 1:13:38 Alright, [Mel: Cool] so we're gonna be on for Thursday at uh, this same, the same time as we did today.

JBK: 1:13:42 All right.

"Cleave." Merriam-Webster.com Dictionary, Merriam-Webster, <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/cleave>. Accessed 29 May. 2024.